

Meeting: City of Roses Community Conversation
Date/time: Tuesday, April 9, 2019
Place: Shaver Elementary School
Purpose: To discuss City of Roses' application for a new Metro solid waste franchise to receive garbage generated within the Metro region for reloading and transport to a landfill for disposal.

- 0:06:37 Rob Nathan: All right, folks. I'm going to go ahead and get started so we can get you out of here on time. Thanks for joining us today. This is a combination of a community conversation about our Metro Solid Waste License process along with a formal DEQ permit period. We'll explain our process as we move forward and I go over the agenda with you all. You know, we wanted to work together as two agencies that regulates all of the facilities and bring our two meetings together and make it easier for you all to not have to attend more than one meeting at a time.
- 0:07:18 My name is Rob Nathan. I'm the Community Engagement Specialist here with Metro. Before I introduce you to some of our other representatives here helping with the meetings I just want to go over a few announcements for folks. So, you know, make sure you take care of your needs. We've got some food back there for folks as well as the key to the restroom. There are two exits to this room if it's an emergency. But if you need to go to the restroom, the restrooms are behind the stage around the corner.
- 0:07:53 You may have noticed when you came in the doors were locked and that's actually school policy. We've got to keep those doors locked but we do have [indistinct] to let folks in. We will be taking photos and also doing an audio recording for our own purposes just to keep track of everything that's happening. We'll also be taking some notes during the Q&A session.
- 00:08:22 Also, you'll notice in the back there are some additional resources on poster board covering some of the topics we'll be talking about on the table there with any information you're welcome to take with you that talk about some of our programs at Metro. Before I introduce folks, I'm going to quickly go over our agenda today just so we have some clarity on what we'll be doing.
- 00:08:52 We'll get started right now with some introductions, explain -- you'll hear from our client manager about our process here at Metro for licensing solid waste facilities. You'll hear from myself. When I'm not facilitating public

meetings, I also oversee our regional grant program, called the community enhancement grants. So you'll hear about that. And then you'll also hear from DEQ, a presentation about their permitting process.

00:09:23 And then you'll also get an opportunity to hear from our facility operator and owner city of [indistinct]. And then we'll open it up for a Q&A. And this is going to be an opportunity for you all to ask questions and get clarity on things that we've already presented to you about Metro's process, about DEQ's process. Sometimes this stuff can get confusing and no question is a stupid question. I may even ask questions for you.

00:09:53 Sometimes we say some jargon, you know, some solid waste jargon that's not translatable to everyone. And I want to support everyone in making sure that what we talk about here today is things that we all can digest and understand 'cause I know that you all are here because you're concerned that it impacts you. And I appreciate everyone showing up today. I know that everyone's got their own schedules and we appreciate you being here. During that Q&A session, you know, we're going to have some ground rules and so I want to make sure everyone gets to ask the questions they need to ask.

00:10:25 And also, feel free if you want comments on the record you can say that for the formal DEQ permit hearing after this in the second hour of the program. And so after we finish that Q&A, we'll have about 20 minutes of Q&A. We'll move on to the formal DEQ permit hearing and Audrey and Jeremy, my colleagues at DEQ will explain that process for you all and you'll have an opportunity to come up and say things on the record.

00:10:53 You'll also have an opportunity to write things down. Not everyone feels comfortable coming up and speaking to the public. And so we'll have comment cards that you can also fill out for DEQ as well. So before I introduce the staff that are here today, are there any electeds in the room that we should know about? Elected officials? Are there any native tribe representation here in the room? Tribal leaders? Any neighborhood association leaders? What's your name?

00:11:30 Annette Stanhope: Annette Stanhope.

Rob Nathan: Annette Stanhope. Okay, and do you represent Argyle neighborhood?

Annette Stanhope: Park Rose.

Rob Nation: Park Rose. Thank you for being here tonight. Anyone else? Then do we have any community-based organizations we should know about? Okay. Oh.

Lori Boisen: Portland Action Planning.

Rob Nathan: Portland Action Planning here with us.

Lori Boisen: Lori Boisen.

Rob Nathan: Lori Boisen. Okay, I'll get clarity on that later. Sorry about that. Thank you all for joining us today. We really appreciate your time.

00:12:00 So my name is Rob Nathan. I'm the Community Engagement Specialist with Metro. We're also joined by Ernest Hayes. Ernest, can you raise your hand? He is your Metro Council [indistinct] who represents the district that we're standing in right now. He is our policy advisor so if you have questions for your Metro elected, he'll be the gentleman you can ask. And then we're also joined by, of course, Hila Ritter. She's our Compliance Manager here at Metro. And we're joined by Warren Johnson.

00:12:31 Warren, can you raise your hand? He's our Director of solid waste information compliance. He's the big boss. And we're joined by Will [indistinct] here in the back. He's going to be taking notes. He's a senior solid waste planner. We're also joined by Enrique Vargas, who is supporting us with the community engagement today. He'll be running the mic during the Q&A. And we're also joined by Jeremy Fleming, who's also going to be engagement for us here and is also a resident in the community. And Kirby, I'm sorry, Jeremy Kirby.

00:13:04 And then we're also joined by, you know, our colleagues here, Audrey O'Brien. She is the Northwest Regional Manager for DEQ. And we're joined by Jeremy Fleming who is our permit manager for DEQ. [indistinct] Before I move into the agenda, I just want to talk a little bit about group agreements. Again, we want this to be a respectful space where everyone can be heard during the process. We ask that you speak for yourself and not for others.

00:13:39 Please don't interrupt others, especially when they have the mic. Limit side conversations. Please silence your cell phones. And please don't applaud, whistle, or boo to indicate support or disagreement. But I know sometimes

we do want to show support for things and I think it would be completely acceptable if something's really resonating for folks, go ahead and put your hand up and you can wave it in the air. We do want to acknowledge that excitement but we just don't want to be disruptive.

- 00:14:10 And we want to make sure we have time for everyone to say what they want to say today. I'm curious. I always hate making group agreements for folks who barely know me without including you all in this process. So is there anything else? I mean, this is your community that we're standing in right now. Is there something else that's not on this list that folks [indistinct]? Go ahead and shout it out.
- 00:14:43 Okay, if we need to revisit this list, I'm happy to do that. And again, I may have to play bad cop today. You may find that I don't want to over regulate folks I don't want anyone to feel silenced. But I want to make sure everyone gets heard today. And if we continue a discussion or a dialog after the meeting, me and some of my colleagues will be available to do so. So I'm going to hand this over to Hila Ritter, our clients manager and she's going to talk a little bit about our metro licensing process.
- 00:15:19 Hila Ritter: So, hi, thank you so much for being here. As Rob said, my name is Hila Ritter. I'm the interim Solid Waste Compliance Manager. So we have an action-packed agenda and I hope that this approach of a Metro and DEQ combined meeting makes the most of your time. [indistinct]. So I'm going to talk about three things. We're going to do an overview of Metro's role, what it takes to be in transportation in Metro and I'm going to talk about the [indistinct].
- 00:16:04 So for number one, Metro's role. So under state law, Metro has broad authority, broad responsibility for planning, managing, and overseeing the regional solid waste system. There's a poster over there in the back that has a picture of regional solid waste system and I encourage you to check it out. There's a lot going on. So you'll notice on that map that Metro has two of our own [indistinct]. You may have been there. We have Central and North Portland and South in Oregon City. And while we have the legal authority to direct all solid waste to our own public facilities, the Metro Council, which is our governing body, is currently in the public interest to include some type of [indistinct] companies in the solid waste system to provide solid waste services directly.

- 00:16:49 So as that map shows back there, there are many categories of solid waste facilities. The two that we're going to talk about tonight are [indistinct] processing. This is called [indistinct] material recovery facility. And transfer stations. Transfer stations manage garbage. We call garbage wet waste. We also call it [indistinct] waste. I'll try to stick with garbage just to keep things simple. A few transfer stations, it was called a franchise for Metro.
- 00:17:20 That's the actually -- we don't call it a license or permit. We call it a franchise. So I'm, again, try to stick with transfer station for the same clarity. If say franchise, that's what I'm trying to say. So Metro manages the region's solid waste system on behalf of the public and we rely on the recently adopted regional waste plan for guidance. So we brought some copies of the executive summary of our regional waste plan. Those are back on the table in the back. The whole thing, the whole document will go on our website if you're interested.
- 00:17:53 For us, I just can't emphasize enough the importance of the regional waste plan. It was developed with community input and other stakeholder input and it's what's going to be guiding our work. And it addresses critical issues like protecting the environment and human health, concerning national resources, advancing environmental literacy, fostering and economical [indistinct] for all, ensuring the resilience of our garbage and recycling system, and providing [indistinct] services. So I'm going to move on to what it takes to be a Metro franchise.
- 00:18:26 So first, a transfer station is not a landfill. It's a consolidation point for the small transfer design for the neighborhood collection routes to drop off that waste which is then scooped up into the long haul trucks to then transfer it out to the desert where the landfills are. So Metro council is the one who makes regulatory decisions regarding garbage. So decision about COR, also known as City of Roses, application will be presented to the Metro council for their determination in May.
- 00:19:00 So for us, when an application comes in, we evaluate it based on the rigorous criteria established for any transfer station to operate [indistinct] region based on the metro code. Once an application can provide all the relevant information demonstrating it can meet that criteria then that complete application is shared during that public comment period to solicit feedback. So we send out that information on postcards to the communities surrounding the facility.

- 00:19:30 We also send out [indistinct] distribution lists and post it on our website. And I take all that information, the application materials, public input, regulatory information from government partners [indistinct] our authorization criteria and put that together in a staff report, which is ultimately a recommendation for the metro council to consider. So final point on this topic before I move on is that metro has regulatory oversight to put a regional solid waste facilities for compliance.
- 00:20:01 So we have general conditions for facilities and it also includes site-specific conditions to any metro authorization as we [indistinct] individual issues. So this meeting and the feedback that you provide to us and to DEQ will inform metro's staff report and your concerns may be things that metro can address through our authorization requirement and oversight that part of the recommendation will go to metro council in May. So my last point, the COR application, the City of Roses application specifically.
- 00:20:33 So there are COR representatives here tonight. They're going to speak so I'm not going to tell you their whole history but I will say briefly that they are a local family-owned company that has been authorized by metro as a dry waste firm. [indistinct] They process mostly construction and demolition materials. They were formerly located at 109th starting in 2013 and they currently have Metro and DEQ authorization to operate as a dry waste [indistinct] facility at the NE 138th location and have been operating there since February of this year.
- 00:21:07 They are now seeking to become a transfer station and also accept garbage that would be consolidated on site and then transported to a landfill. So let me be clear about what this means. It means that there are two distinct activities: the dry waste material covering facility which is already happening and it's all about sorting and recovering recyclables. And if approved, the transfer station which is all about consolidating waste into semi-trucks first in, first out and [indistinct] material in a 24-hour basis for transport to the landfills.
- 00:21:40 So the application that COR submitted to Metro is complete and what I mean by that is that this company has demonstrated that it can comply with the many city, state, and Metro regulatory standards for franchise. So those are the three things that I wanted to share with all of you so you know where Metro's coming from and how we evaluate solid waste facility applications. So I look forward to [indistinct] during the Q&A and thank you so much.

- 00:22:09 Rob Nathan: Thanks, Hila. I know that was a lot of information. If any of you felt like you missed any of it, it's okay. You can ask questions about things that we've already talked about. I know it's the end of the day and we're talking about a lot of technical stuff and we do this every day and you don't. So don't feel bad if you need to ask Hila any questions about what she just talk about. I'm going to just talk to you briefly about our community enhancement grant program. It's roughly any solid waste facility in the region that manages wet waste.
- 00:22:43 So if City of Roses is successful in receiving a wet waste license through their facility, there's a dollar fee added to each time that comes through that facility. It goes into a community enhancement grant. Currently, there are seven different grant portfolios around the region providing investments in community. It's roughly almost a million dollars annually across the region. And so depending on how much comes through that community, that dictates how much money comes through.
- 00:23:20 We've recently just passed a 2030 regional waste plan and in that regional waste plan, this is public you can access it online, we do have an action item to increase that tonnage fee. And so communities should start seeing even more dollars coming through there into the grant program. The tallest poster up there in the back kind of provides an overview of the program, if folks want to learn more. But basically, I'll just quickly go over what we define as enhancement currently.
- 00:23:55 There is an amendment to increase our definition of enhancement to support our most vulnerable communities, historically marginalized communities. And currently what enhancement is defined as is increase in employment opportunities or economic opportunities, rehabilitating each property capital investments, any kind of projects around the community or sorry, environmental conservation or sustainability, toxins reductions, waste minimization, improving public safety, programs that benefit youth and elderly, programs that focus on the marginalized communities, and really, anything that improves mobility in the neighborhood.
- 00:24:42 Some examples of organizations that have been funded here in Portland, community alliance [indistinct]. They receive community investment grant funds that supports renter's rights and housing stability. Meals on Wheels, Friendly House are both organizations that provide food security to seniors. And some of our public schools also receive support and literacy programs.

So those are just a few examples of some of the projects that service the community. One thing that you should know, there is the grant committee that's established [indistinct].

- 00:25:21 They will establish community enhancement boundary. And so that boundary will dictate who should be benefited from community enhancement grants. And so that boundary will be established around this community. And then programs that service residents and represent community programs that will receive funding. I am, of course, available this evening if you have further questions about the program. I'm going to send it over to Jeremy Fleming and he's going to tell us a little bit about the DEQ process.
- 00:26:01 Jeremy Fleming: All right. Those of you with [indistinct]. Just real quick, I'm Jeremy Fleming. I work with the Department of Environmental Quality. I'm an inspector and permit manager [indistinct] facility. Brief explanation [indistinct] regulates solid waste. DEQ is a government state agency, the job is to protect the quality of the Oregon environment. We get our authority from laws passed by Oregon legislature and [indistinct]. It's these rules that carry the power of law that dictate how our facilities are required to operate.
- 00:26:44 Solid waste facilities require to apply for a permit DEQ prior to [indistinct] operations. An important part of the permit application process is to solicit input from the community especially for neighbors [indistinct]. DEQ evaluates the [indistinct] permit conditions based on site-specific conditions, input from the community, and regulatory requirements. DEQ has a draft of permit modification that's included in the package I sent you [indistinct].
- 00:27:20 Permit law is to allow City of Roses facility to receive a transfer when household garbage [indistinct]. On October 30, 2017 DEQ issued a material recovery facility permit to City of Roses to operate at an existing facility located on Northeast 138th. Dry waste recovery operations started in February.
- 00:27:50 On October 19, 2018 City of Roses submitted an application to modify their DEQ permit to transfer commercial loads of municipal wet waste garbage at this facility on 138th. City of Roses proposes [indistinct] for commercial haulers. The facility will not be open to the public. So currently, the facility's taking dry waste including wood, metal, plastic, cardboard, drywall, concrete [indistinct].

- 00:28:27 The facility is planning infrastructure upgrades to continue [indistinct] municipal waste receiving area. [indistinct] is the term DEQ uses to describe [indistinct] household garbage. [indistinct] will be held on site until it's transported to a waste facility by the waste water hauling company. City of Roses will be required to update [indistinct] operation plans to DEQ through approval including necessary infrastructure improvements prior to them being allowed to accept [indistinct].
- 00:29:06 City of Roses has [indistinct] procedures in operations compliance to minimize dust, vectors such as vermin and other pests. [indistinct] facility and DEQ will be performing periodic compliance inspections to ensure that the facility is being [indistinct] permit. Based on the submitted application, DEQ has identified the City of Roses annual [indistinct] Oregon regulations and conditions of the permit to ensure the facility will be protective over the environment. That's it. That's all I have right now. Thank you for your time. I think we're going to move on to Q&A [indistinct]. Thank you.
- 00:29:51 Rob Nathan: Thanks, Jeremy. Actually, before we move on to the Q&A, we're going to hand it over to Alando Simpson. Wanted to give him the opportunity to speak about the facility that's up for discussion.
- 00:30:28 Alando Simpson: [indistinct] But no, I think it's really important that we share some words just primarily predicated on the history of the company. All trials and tribulations that this company has had to go through [indistinct] today and have the opportunity to have a transfer station environment where not a lot of [indistinct] are welcome. And it's almost near impossible. I just [indistinct]. And first off, how's everybody doing? Okay. [indistinct]
- 00:31:03 But just for the record, I'm Alando Simpson. I am the Vice President of the company that my father actually started back in 1996 when I was in middle school. And I just wanted to give him an opportunity to say a couple things just about who we are, what we stand by and most importantly, the values and the ethos and ethics that he embodies and most importantly, how that fabricates throughout the entire organization and more importantly, how it's going to become the foundation for not only our business as it is today but how we interact and work with our local regulators and our community stakeholders but more importantly how that transitions onto the future generations. And so, Mr. Simpson.
- [inaudible]

00:32:32 Al Simpson: [indistinct] was always going in a landfill. And, you know, I could see the future. You know, I'm 63 years old and Oregon [indistinct] between Seattle and California with [indistinct] you know, the biggest places, the big states. But I could see people coming. There's a lot of space here. And what I saw was all the garbage we were throwing away was going to the landfill and I wanted to make a difference.

00:33:01 Recycling, you know, I saw it coming. And there was something, you know, that I thought we could make a difference. So, you know, I went and bought a truck and a can [indistinct] about eight, ten trucks, which we all do on Fridays. And this wet waste thing that everybody's kind of concerned about, you know, I really feel there's changes in the wet waste, where they're burying wet waste now.

00:33:38 But there's people [indistinct] composting and we're talking with some people who have a real [indistinct]. Before I leave, I want to make a difference and something different than hauling it to a landfill. And so we need this opportunity to keep moving our business forward, to create jobs.

00:34:11 I don't think, you know, I'm from 138th and Sandy. It's on the other side of the tracks. And we're not the garbage company that comes in. But just like them taking their wet waste to us, you know, it will say -- it's more trucks from running from out here all the way down to metro, burning fuel. It's a lot closer and I just think for one thing, that's a start. Less garbage trucks off the road running down I-5 across the Fremont Bridge. And in the long run, I think you'll save [indistinct]. So that's kind of where we are right now. And I just want the opportunity. So thanks for listening.

[applause]

00:35:08 Alando Simpson: Thank you, sir. [laughter] We fight a lot so this is a very [indistinct]. So just to give you a little bit more context, so yes, we are going to talk about a waste-related activity, which is the whole purpose of this process, which I am totally in support of because the last thing I want to do and what has always been instilled into me very early on is, you know, work with your neighbors. Don't work against your neighbors and try to minimize problems as much as you possibly can.

00:35:45 But as a fourth generation Portlander, I feel like we, myself and my siblings and my family, we have a larger responsibility not only to the lineage within

our family but more importantly, to our community in which we come from to try to figure out new and innovative ways of how we manage and maintain and process things that people no longer see a value in, things you throw away, right? And so for us, we've just been working diligently over the past five years, ever since the inception of our first facility down on Northeast 109th in between Airport Way and Sandy.

00:36:23 And we have really, really cool and intriguing and inspiring ideas we're going to be pursuing for this industry going forward and we're really excited about it. And I think it's really hard for people to grasp just given the nature of the term "waste" or the term "trash" or the term "dump". It has a very negative connotation. And the last thing I want to do is allow that that perception persists and I want to be able to change minds and more importantly change the way in which we actually manage things that we no longer see a value in.

00:37:03 Because I truly believe that the things that we waste are our most precious natural resources that can actually become the catalyst for our new economy in the 21st century. And the other thing aside from just waste that is very important, which is instilled in us very early as my father always talked to us about was making sure that you take care of the people and make sure you provide opportunities for people. He eluded to job opportunities but I think we want to do is we want to take it a step further because knowing the challenges we face as a society today where people that look like me are typically living on very little means economically or locked up in jail cells.

00:37:43 It is a disgrace. And so as a business owner, as somebody who has to provide job opportunities, somebody who have to contribute to the economy, somebody who has to pay taxes, we feel like it's our responsibility - hello? - to not only minimize waste that's going in garbage cans but wasted human capital and human potential that is concentrated out here in East Portland. And I feel like a lot of times, and I share this with a lot of community organizations that East Portland, all of us that live out here, we know we're neglected. We don't get the attention that everyone gets in the central city.

00:38:15 And so what are we going to do about that? And one way we actually create change in this community and get more attention and more resources is by working collectively and have a stronger voice. If we work in silos and we're fragmented, we'll never be strong enough to shift the paradigm that currently exists in our region. And so that is something that we're going to be focusing heavily on going forward. And just a couple of things to highlight, right now City of Roses, as he indicated earlier, started with one truck and

one container in '96 off an equity line of a house that I grew up in, in North Portland, which he bought for \$35,000 I think.

00:38:52 Think about that. And what it's turned into today where we now employ 53 individuals, 80 percent of those folks are people of color and actually, 100 percent of our executive team are either people of color, women, or even veterans. And so those are things that we're very excited about and proud about because as we look to the future and we start thinking about the bigger picture, it's more about the circular economy and a close looped system so that not only are we, as I talked about earlier, minimizing waste from going to landfills, we're finding higher and better uses for these materials but more importantly finding higher and better uses for people who are left to the side that don't have economic and job opportunities.

00:39:33 And I think that's really important for us because I believe that the future of the waste industry is going to be the raw materials to manufacture. And we actually have even started down that path already. And Valarie and Carrie back here who's [indistinct] something we've been working on really heavily and diligently on figuring out new alternatives to higher and better uses of dimensional lumber because a lot of the material is going into landfills or being burned in incinerators. And we don't think that that's a sustainable model for the future. And so as I close, I welcome and am totally open to all the comments, suggestions, or even fears or concerns. And again, I want to work with the community, not against the community because at the end of the day, this is all about humanity. This is all about all of us working in a concerted effort to make sure that we're making a better, livable, resilient community for our future generations.

[applause]

00:40:39 Rob Nathan: So we're going to move on to our Q&A section before we want to be able to have an opportunity to answer questions from the audience, provide clarity about some of the things we've talked about. You've heard from metro on our licensing requirements for a solid waste facility, particularly licensing wet waste coming through this transfer station. You've heard also from DEQ about their permit process. So before we move into that formal permit process -- and Enrique do you have a mic? Excellent. If someone wants to go ahead and raise their hand, Enrique will move through the room and answer questions. We have a question over here. And I'll actually get that question started. Sir, what's your name?

- 00:41:21 Gail Bash: Gail Bash. I've lived in the area almost 40 years. Everybody I talk to is interested in smell. [indistinct] So far, the waste facility has not been intrusive. However, if you put it in and then they violate it and it's starts stinking, you'll say, "We're working on it. We're working on it." But we suffer with it. So what are you going to do about that?
- 00:41:58 Rob Nathan: That's a great question. So who wants to take on the answer to that question? I think that's a combination of Metro and DEQ because we both have enforcement processes with our permitting. And so why don't I hand it over to Hila. She'll talk about Metro's role in regulating smell from wet waste and then she'll pass it on to DEQ to talk about how they regulate with their permit.
- 00:42:25 Hila Ritter: Thank you. So really where it starts for us is an operating plan. And in the operating plan there are requirements in how they need to mitigate that before it ever becomes a problem and make sure that things -- that it doesn't ever get to the point you're describing where it's creating off-site impacts. We also have our inspectors. Metro has two facility inspectors. Our inspectors perform about seven inspections per facility per year, more if there are compliance issues at that site.
- 00:42:58 So those are unannounced, frequent inspections. So we're eyes and ears and nose on the ground. It also includes surveying the surrounding community. And then as far as enforcement goes, we take a progressive approach to enforcement. So we start with technical assistance, if something is going on [indistinct] we start with working with the facility operator to identify what the problems are and how they can be resolved.
- 00:43:29 And then if that approach doesn't work then we have a progressive approach, so all the way up to notices of violations, which can include penalties. And if that doesn't work then we can move forward to more aggressive things such as [indistinct], cutting off incoming paid stock. And so there's a variety of ways we can approach it. [indistinct] Yes, Metro can terminate a franchise at any time for any of the solid waste authorizations. We can also amend them at any time if they need to be amended. And I'll hand it over --
- 00:44:13 Rob Nathan: I'm sorry. I'm going to play that facilitator role. Before you hand it over to DEQ, can you also remind folks, maybe some example of current regulation in the license that is designed to reduce odor already? Or does that exist?

Hila Ritter: Yeah.

Rob Nathan: Can you give us some examples of what that is?

00:44:32 Hila Ritter: Yeah, so again, it's primarily through the operating plan where those things are all addressed and we have requirements of the kinds of things that the operating plan needs to include, which is things like how they're going to address odor. And another thing that I'll add is that the city of Portland is responsible for the land use decisions and the city has a requirement in place that before City of Roses can start accepting [indistinct] waste, they need to put in an odor misting neutralization system.

00:45:06 So that's something that needs to be reviewed by DEQ. But that's another method and mechanism to control that. So I'm going to hand it over to DEQ to continue to answer this question and then we'll start taking more.

Jeremy Fleming: Okay thanks. DEQ's process is similar in that the operations plans is where it's described. For one, how they'll receive complaints from the community. So if odor becomes an issue, you can complain to Metro or DEQ or the facility and there's conditions in the permit and operating -- describe how City of Roses is to respond to these complaints.

00:45:54 Also, DEQ provides compliance, you know, I know there are facilities that have problems with odors. We recognize that we're getting complaints and we log them and confirm that the odors [indistinct] from the site. We work with the operators to make procedural changes right away. You know, stop this operation or make these changes. Again, with the city of Portland land use conditional use, one of the conditions is that it requires to transfer garbage, I think it's within 24 hours. So that is another condition that will hopefully minimize odor.

00:46:40 Rob Nathan: So we've got a few folks here in the front who also have questions. Go for it.

Man: Hi, so you touched on a couple of these already including inspections but you mentioned 24 hours, first-in, first-out. Does that mean nothing's on site more than 24 hours?

Hila Ritter: Correct. So the City of Portland, what they put in place says they can't keep liter onsite for more than 24 hours. If they keep anything overnight, they can keep a maximum of one truckload.

00:47:21 It is inside in an enclosed container inside the building. And so that's the other thing that I would add about odor management is that all of the garbage needs to be dumped inside the building. It stays inside the building when it's being loaded into the long haul trucks and then they're fully enclosed when they leave.

Rob Nathan: All right, just a quick follow-up up that. So there's also [indistinct].

00:47:50 Yeah, and so when clarifying that, I just want to say we've got a lot of questions so just one question per person and then we'll try to circle back to you. But do you want to get your question about leachate?

Hila Ritter: So what is it?

Rob Nathan: Does that fall under the 24-hour --

Hila Ritter: No. So the leachate is, again, the liquid that comes out of the garbage. If it comes out of the garbage and so their system at the facility is they have a catch [indistinct] it's a catch basin and it's indoors, fully enclosed.

00:48:30 And it stays onsite until it gets pumped into a truck and then that gets transported to a waste garbage maintenance plant. So that does not have to be removed within 24 hours. But it stays onsite inside the closed building and there's infrastructure that is required to get that all in place and functioning smoothly before they can accept waste garbage. And so that's going to include grating and putting in [indistinct] and having all of that infrastructure fully in place.

00:49:07 Rob Nathan: Enrique, do you know who's next?

Patricia Donahue: Patricia Donahue. Do you mention the fact that [indistinct] trucks with waste materials [indistinct] 24 hours. I've had the pleasure of following garbage trucks down the street and they have a lot of [indistinct] a lot of trucks that are going to be going in that way. How are you going to control [indistinct] like that?

00:49:41 Rob Nathan: So I'm going to assume that that may be a question for PBOT related to transportation but Hila, do you have an answer?

Hila Ritter: Yeah, I guess the only thing I can say to that is that the trucks that are coming to City of Roses are required to be enclosed so they have to be covered in some way. So there is containment requirements for the trucks. And they also have to have adequate queuing capacity and vehicle capacity onsite at the facility so that they can be managing all of that right there on the site so that there aren't queues of trucks impacting traffic and creating odors in other places. But yeah, the trucks as an odor source other than keeping them enclosed.

00:50:37 Lynn Felton: Hello, Lynn Felton. Leachate that you were referencing is there a sense as to the volume that [indistinct] of the wet waste that's [indistinct]. - - operating plan that's been received and looked at. Can you be specific what is in the operating plan that will prevent that?

00:51:09 Rob Nathan: Thank you. First question was why [indistinct]. There is no limit to the amount of leachate that the facility can accept. There's also, for DEQ, there's no limit for the [indistinct] lead waste they can accept. That's not usually a condition of the DEQ permits. And then regarding --

Lynn Felton: What in the specifically corresponding plan is in there to limit odor?

00:51:56 Hila Ritter: Yeah, so I'll answer the -- as far as the leachate, so like I said, with the infrastructure and permits in that project is happening now so the amount that they'll be able to have is going to be dependent on the system that is designed for that facility. So that's going to dictate the amount of the leachate. We don't have that volume amount at this time. And then as far as the volume of materials, so Metro's different than DEQ in that we do regulate the amount of -- the volume of waste that can come in and then we also regulate where the material goes after it leaves the facility.

00:52:33 And so we do that through a couple of different vehicles. We have a franchise, which is the facility site and what can come in. And then we have the [indistinct] which dictates where the waste can go after it leaves the facility and how much waste can go. And so City of Roses has applied for 30,000 tons annually. Metro is working on recommending 15,000 tons for the calendar year 2019. And the reason for that is because we are working on a tonnage allocation technology -- this is where it's going to get really in the weeds, folks.

- 00:53:09 So we [indistinct] regional solid waste system and we also operate our own transportations. And so in order to make sure that we can continue [indistinct] we need to ensure that a certain amount of waste comes to our facilities and then we allow other amounts of waste to go to other private facilities. And so historically, we've approached that on a, you know, we monitor the volumes that facilities take and then that's essentially what we grant them.
- 00:53:41 And Metro has recently undertaken a project that I just referred to, tonnage allocation technology project to determine how much waste each private facility can take. And it's looking at a lot of factors that things such as [indistinct], where the facilities are located, where the waste sheds are, where the waste is being generated, and many other things. So that tonnage allocation technology is going to be in place effective in 2020.
- 00:54:15 So what we're talking about, the 15,000 tons is for calendar year 2019 only because in 2020, we will have a methodology that is going to be prescribed and will apply to all transportations in the system. So that's going to [indistinct] going forward. So we're looking at 15,000 tons for this year because they asked for 30,000 tons. This won't be effected until May at the absolute earliest so 15 is half of 30.
- [indistinct]
- 00:54:47 Hila Ritter: Yeah, so the offering plan is available online on the Metro website in full. So we can make sure to get you that link so you can have access to it. But it's on the public notice page for Metro, the whole operating plan.
- 00:55:04 Rob Nathan: I want to remind folks, one question per person. Also, [indistinct] portfolio, I can tell you that just because a facility gets a certain tonnage allocation does not mean that's how many tons they end up processing. So it may not be 15,000 tons that go through the facility. That's how much they'll be licensed for.
- 00:55:27 Woman: I have a question about -- I like the term, "looking into the future". I'm looking into my commute future. 138 is already a nightmare because of Costco traffic at all hours. Now, also, the train, also [indistinct]. So on a daily basis, I'm sure there's going to be a ton of trucking just because of the new facility. And I want to know how that's going to effect on a daily basis for my commute.

00:56:00 Hila Ritter: Yeah, I hear you. I can't [indistinct]. So Metro relies on our government partners to inform land use allowances, which includes looking at traffic. So as part of the City of Portland land use process, City of Roses had to do a traffic impact study and submit that to the city for review by PBOT and ODOT and it is allowing, you know, their proposal and the volume of trucks is allowed in the city. And so it's outside the city's criteria.

[indistinct]

00:56:45 Rob Nathan: [indistinct] require that they've already done that process for the city. So again, we tried to come together with DEQ today and speak to you about the things that we have jurisdiction over and unfortunately, traffic is not one of those things. But in our license requirement, we do require that they go through that process with PBOT.

00:57:08 Hila Ritter: Jeremy, we have the land use fact sheet, right? So we have a one page fact sheet that was provided by the City of Portland. It's just a one pager about their land use so if you're interested in reading and understanding more about that, we have those. Jeremy is putting them on the table.

Rob Nathan: And real quick, [indistinct] comment for them but folks have their hands up. And so if you want to ask Alando some more questions about transportation, I want to open that up after the hearing. But I want to make sure I'm getting to more folks' questions 'cause it seems like we have a lot.

00:57:41 Bradley Stalding: My name is Bradley.

Rob Nathan: Hi, Bradley.

Bradley Stalding: I live on 119th across the street from [indistinct] facility right now. [indistinct] Traffic is a tremendous issue and I know you want to [indistinct]. Currently, the city has [indistinct] owns, operates, [indistinct] and it never gets taken care of [indistinct]. [indistinct] Marine Drive is as wide as it's ever going to get. [indistinct] that this company is going to be experiencing. Hopefully, [indistinct]. [indistinct] 50, 75, 100 trips a day. Traffic will back up [indistinct] there to your house.

00:58:54 Rob Nathan: I just want to make sure, do you have a question? Also, if folks have comments, you will be able to make comments [indistinct].

Bradley Stalding: What's going to be done about that?

Rob Nathan: So it sounds like folks want to hear about traffic. Is there anyone who has a question not related to traffic that hasn't been answered? Okay, I want to be able to move on to those questions and then feel free to make a comment during the public hearing but also Alando does have some answers around traffic as well. You had your hand up.

00:59:26 Woman: I just want to know how far the smell is going to go. How far will I smell it? I mean, will we smell it on this side of Sandy Boulevard?

[indistinct]

Rob Nathan: Has anyone been to Metro Central Transfer Station? Or Metro South in Oregon City near Home Depot?

Man: I think you should explain where the smell comes from. [indistinct]

00:59:58 Rob Nathan: Okay, I'm just curious if you've been to some of those facilities. You might have a better understanding of transfer. The odor that does or doesn't exist near transfer stations. I am not qualified to answer this question. I'm just someone in the public who has an opinion on that.

01:00:13 Hila Ritter: So the expectation is there won't be offsite odors. I can't guarantee that there aren't ever going to be offsite odors but the expectation is that they operate in a manner that is not generating odors offsite. And if that isn't happening there are lots of vehicles to deal with that. So the first one that I would suggest to propose is you contact City of Roses directly. Alando has talked about how he wants to have a relationship with you, he wants to be in the community with you and working collaboratively. So that's one option. If you're not comfortable with that or if that isn't seeming to work or you just don't want to for whatever reason and you'd rather talk to me, you're welcome to contact Metro.

01:00:47 We have a complaint form that's a web form that you can fill out that we ask some specific questions because it's really helpful to us to get some specific information. We have business cards on the back table that has information about our complain web form. We also have the recycling information center, which is open six days a week, Monday through Saturday from 8:30 to 5 with real live people who answer the phone that can help answer your questions or take your information or [indistinct] if that's what you need. DEQ also has a complain process. So there's several ways if you are experiencing impacts,

which, again, for odor, I don't expect that to happen. But if you are or others, you can contact the facility operator, you can contact their regulators, Metro, and DEQ.

01:01:38 Rob Nathan: We just have time for a couple more questions. I want to hand it over to the people I have seen raise their hand. So the young lady right here, young lady right here, and young lady right here because I know you've had your hands up now. Unfortunately, we'll have to move on to the public hearing section 'cause I really want to make sure people can get their comments on the record.

01:01:59 Woman: I'll be quick. Do you know the policy that outlines certain timelines for escalation? Like, I mean, just say it does smell and say I decided to become a pain in the butt and I file a complaint. How long does it take? I mean, do you have something that tells me how long it'll be until you respond to this or is it just --

[crosstalk]

01:02:25 Hila Ritter: That's a great question. The answer to do we have an accessible enforcement guide. The answer is no, not at this time. It's in development. But we do -- our process for when we receive a complaint is that we respond by -- if we receive an email complaint or on the web form, we respond generally in that same day, certainly within 48 hours. And then we contact the facility operator and share that information with them. The most useful complaint information for us is timing information so that we can hear about that right away and we can inform the facility operator right away so they can fix the problem.

01:03:01 So, you know, we welcome comment and input from folks all of the time. Most impactful, the best way to be letting us know is right away. "Hey, I was outside doing yard work and I smelled this odor. I experienced this issue. Come back at your earliest convenience." And you let us know and we contact the facility operator right away and we say, "Hey, what's going on? What can we do to fix this? We're hearing from the citizens." So we respond quickly and individually to each complaint but we don't have an escalation policy that's accessible.

01:03:43 Audrey O'Brien: You're hearing a lot from Metro. DEQ has very similar requirements in the Metro license. One of the requirements in the permit is for City of Roses to respond to complaints they receive within 24 hours and

they need to keep a log of it and they need to keep information about how they've addressed the complaint. The other things that occurred today is that the way the facility is going to be designed, it's going to be designed to minimize any possibility for offsite odors. And that's something that DEQ and Metro will be approving by reviewing the plans and discuss expectations for the modifications.

01:04:25 Rob Nathan: As I said, we have time for two more questions. We will be available after the public hearing to answer questions that you have. Alando's also here to answer questions. We also will have note cards where folks can write questions and comments to Metro and there's also a formal process for submitting comments to DEQ.

[indistinct]

01:04:47 Rob Nathan: I believe some of you may want to get your comments on the record for DEQ and I want to make sure that you have enough time to do that. And then afterwards, we have time for questions. We can answer those personally with you.

Woman: Okay, my question has a lot of parts to it. [indistinct] I have been to the station out there in Oregon City. So I'm wondering if this facility is going to be like that where people can come and drop things off on their own or is it just being done commercially.

01:05:20 And if it is being done commercially, how many trucks are going to be working? How many trips a day are they making? And how are they -- you said that [indistinct]. Some other trucks are coming in, big trucks to take them away. Where's their access point to get on highways because it is a highway. Where's their access point and what time of day [indistinct]?

01:05:46 Rob Nathan: Okay, so I'm going to try to address one question at a time. We did ask folks to ask one question. Also, I'm getting a sense that -- and DEQ wants to offer time for folks to ask more questions if you'd prefer that over more time for comments on the record. So I'm going to gage that in the room after we answer your questions. So you had a question about self-haul versus commercial haul. That's one of your questions. So let's first answer that question.

01:06:15 Hila Ritter: Yeah, so it is a commercial facility only. It's not going to be open for self-haul for individual or [indistinct]. And in the application, they had

projected between 15 and 30 trucks a day. They [indistinct] -- yeah, between 15 and 30 [indistinct] trucks is what we have in our application materials. And trying to remember the other parts of your question.

01:06:47 Woman: I asked about their access point. Are they going on from Sandy or are they going on from --?

Hila Ritter: My understanding is that they're going to be primarily using Airport Way but the traffic impact study doesn't designate which routes or the land use, I should say, doesn't designate which routes they can or cannot use.

Woman: Does it say something about the Metro Line that they're doing? [indistinct] Is it going to change my commute [indistinct]?

Rob Nathan: Is the impact study available to the public?

Woman: That is a City of Portland document. So it would be through the City of Portland.

01:07:32 Rob Nathan: So that's a question for the City of Portland. I want to make sure -- I do ask that folks ask one question. I understand that sometimes it's compounded. Before I move on and Hila's going to get some of that information for you and we're going to come back to that. I want to get a sense from folks in the room how many folks here want to continue on with our Q&A section versus public comment on the record?

01:08:00 Woman: If there's just a few people who need to provide public comment to DEQ and the rest want to stay and have a discussion, I'm happy to set up a microphone out in the hall and take the verbal comments on the DEQ permit if you want to continue with the discussion here in the room. Is that something that would work for people or do you all want to hear the comments that DEQ receives?

01:08:22 Rob Nathan: So how many folks would like to split up? We can continue this conversation and then DEQ can take public comments in the other room. How many folks are in favor of that? How many folks would like to have a DEQ guy in this room where you can give your comments on the record in front of everyone right now? I'm going to ask that we stick to the agenda.

- 01:08:51 And also I want to -- if we get through the public comment period on the record then we will be able to move -- we can come back to Q&A. But we do want to make sure that we leave time for this process because this is an important process that DEQ does and we're trying to also provide an opportunity to have a community conversation. Before I do that, I did promise you one more question and I want to stick to what I promised.
- 01:09:17 Woman: So she was saying something about a misting unit to minimize smell. What exactly are you misting into the air? What kind of chemicals is going into the air to eliminate odor?
- Hila Ritter: I don't know the answer to that. That's a City of Portland requirement. So they have it in their land use decision, they have a specific model that's indicated. Outside of just looking up that information, that's not something I have any information about.
- 01:09:59 Alando Simpson: Yeah, part of the land use hearing with the City of Portland and the hearings officer was everything everybody is bringing up were all concerns that were through that process. That concern, the best way that we could do it -- well, first, before I say it, odor is typically generated when things decompose. So we're not dealing with a mass amount of organic material, compost [indistinct]. That's where you get your real odor from.
- 01:10:32 That's the first thing. Second thing is that since waste is not going to be onsite for that long and that description for the 24-hour rule for something to be onsite and in a trailer is only predicated on if there were an event where we could not leave or if we didn't have a truck who came in and he was done for his day, right? It's not in our best interest to keep waste onsite because it's going to cost us more and it makes it more inefficient. We want to keep things moving.
- 01:11:04 Because it just gets in the way and it's a nuisance, which would create all these other problems, which it's not in our best interest to have problems because we don't want to go out of business. So that's the practical part of it. The other part of this as it relates to the land use process was they had suggested figuring out ways to minimize odor and even if there were odors and that came from the eco-store sustainable solution and you can look it up online. It's called eco-store 64 [indistinct] something like that.
- 01:11:34 But it's a very sustainable material that is eco-friendly and it doesn't have any additional effect on humans. That was our main concern to ensure that if

it did call for a situation where that material or that eco-store needed to be utilized, it wasn't harmful to our employees.

Rob Nathan: I apologize. We are going to move on to the public hearing section. And then once we are done with that, we can move back to Q&A. But I do want to give time for you all to get your comments and concerns on the record with DEQ and then we can move back to Q&A.

01:12:11 Also, we do have some question cards if folks did not feel comfortable asking questions during that session. Audrey, do you want to kick us off?

Alando Simpson: There's one last thing I want to make sure people understood. So the process as they had indicated before, we're already a dry waste facility. So 99 percent of our site is predicated, which is 12 acres to dry waste recycling and disposal of residual materials. 99 percent of 12 acres. This portion, this waste-related activity is only 10,000 square feet out of a 12-acre site. So it's less than one percent of the entire site. That's just for context.

[indistinct]

01:13:09 Alando Simpson: The [indistinct] is closer to the residential area [indistinct] industrial. And quite frankly, as somebody who used to live on 138th or sorry, 130th, 4130 Northeast 130th for over five years, I was more concerned with the sound of the train and the fact that a train runs through there at 50 miles an hour with oil tanks on it is a bigger concern for me. And I mean, again, I'm here to work with you guys and be transparent so I'm looking forward to continuing the dialogue.

01:13:47 Audrey O'Brien: All right. My name is Audrey O'Brien. I am the materials manager [indistinct] DEQ in the Northwest region office. I'm responsible for signing the permits that DEQ has drafted and that you're here tonight to comment on. So thank you very much for coming tonight. The questions are really, really good. If you would like to submit the questions you asked already as a comment to DEQ, please feel free to do that when you come up to give your testimony tonight.

01:14:19 The purpose of tonight's hearing is for DEQ to accept comments from you on proposed DEQ solid waste permit modification for the City of Roses to begin to accept and transfer household garbage waste to other disposal sites. Tonight's hearing is an opportunity for you to provide verbal comments to

DEQ on post-permit modification. The information that is most helpful to us is to hear any specific concerns you have about the permit conditions that are in the draft permit that most of you received by mail and some of you picked up here tonight.

- 01:14:55 DEQ issued a public notice on February 28 requesting comments on the draft permit modification for City of Roses to receive and transfer commercial loads of municipal waste at the facility located at 4530 Northeast 138th Ave in Portland. DEQ also provided notice that DEQ would hold this public hearing jointly with Metro to take verbal comments from the public, from you. We are also accepting written comments and will continue to accept. You can give written comments to me tonight or you can submit written comments to DEQ by Thursday at 5pm.
- 01:15:35 The comments are weighed equally and you can find our email to submit public comments online or get the notice that was on the back table when you came in today. I have noted that there are seven people that signed up to give us comments. So I'll call those seven people up and at the end of their comments, if anyone else wants to come up, raise your hand and I'll invite you up to the table.
- 01:16:10 We are recording the comments we receive on this tape recorder here. But I'm going to give you the microphone so everyone can hear your comments. Once the comment period closes, DEQ does evaluate the comments we received. We will make permit adjustments if appropriate and then we'll proceed with issuing the permit. And we'll make available our response to the comments that we received to the public and to you.
- 01:16:41 And if you signed up tonight and you give us your email, we'll send you the response to the comments. So I'm ready to start. So I'm going to ask the first person to come up and the first person I have down and I'm sorry, I'm not going to be able to read it very well. Mary Elizabeth Ketchal. Is that right? All right. Next is Mae Dunham. No, somebody Donahue, I'm sorry. Jane Donahue. I'm sorry, I'm misreading it. So if that's you, please come on up. And will you please state your name.
- 01:17:30 Jane Donahue: Jane Donahue. Well, I want to stand. I have several concerns but a lot of it has to do with traffic and how much -- what are the nature of the trucks? Are they 12-wheelers or big semis?

Audrey O'Brien: So, I'm sorry, we can't answer your questions while you're providing comments. If you would just provide the comments. And if you have questions, we will answer them when we respond to the comments.

01:18:03 Jane Donahue: I guess my comment is I do not want to see increased truck traffic on Sandy Boulevard. My comment is I don't want more pollution given truck traffic, noise pollution. I assume that these are long haul trucks, which are semis that will be stopping at several lights probably in front of my neighborhood so I'm concerned about noise pollution.

01:18:36 I'm concerned about the frequency of trucks and what time of day and night they'll be running. There was talk about how much in-traffic it would be but there was no mention of how much traffic is going to be going down it every day. I'm also concerned about the leachate in the Columbia schools. Has ground water been addressed in the plan? I'm concerned about ground water and the leachate.

01:19:10 And I'm just overall concerned about the biggest land development in the city is happening just down the street at 122nd. And I think we're anticipating a lot more people coming, more densely population. So it seems like a contradiction that we're having expanded garbage transfer station built in while there's this wonderful development going in just down the street, which is going to attract more people to the neighborhood. So those are my comments.

Audrey O'Brien: Next is Lynn Felton.

01:20:03 Lynn Felton: Hello, so [indistinct] but as I say -- [indistinct]. My concern is one, the Park Rose School District, a third of the children are learning English as a second language. That means that their parents most likely do not speak English. I received this notice in English.

01:20:35 I put in a request to the DEQ for Spanish, I received nothing back. My concern is that a third of our community have no idea due to language what is going on here. And I will also note a lot of those people may live down close to Sandy and so therefore, the people most impacted may not even be aware of what's going on due to language. And I'd like to -- I can't ask a question because our question time is limited but I'd like to know what the law is as far as the DEQ having to communicate with people in the area.

- 01:21:15 Further, as mentioned, in 614, the fire protection permit, the core facility is literally right next to the Union Pacific Rail tracks. We've all seen from the Oregonian and the OPP reporting that we really have no idea how many oil trucks are going through those lines. It was made clear in that reporting that Washington State has much stricter laws than Oregon does so it's a high probability those trains will be going on that Union Pacific Line to the [indistinct] transport center.
- 01:21:58 What in fire protection is required for a possible oil spill next to a franchise wet waste facility? Okay, as far as traffic -- oh, I'd also like to comment that there were concerns raised in the questions and the City of Portland representatives were not here to answer it. As a community meeting, I don't understand why all participants were not here to address the community concerns.
- 01:22:39 Finally, as far as traffic, I'd like to note that I believe Mr. Simpson is on the Oregon Department of Transportation Commission and therefore has relations to the people who determine the traffic studies. I believe that gives him an unfair advantage to the community since I assume nobody represented right here, any of us are members of ODOT or PBOT.
- 01:23:10 Further, I'd like to put forth that Mr. Simpson has in various community public formats said that he is all for -- and as he said here capitalizing on human potential. That human potential includes, and I caught it but I also raise it as a concern, people who are convicted and being able to get people who have been convicted of crimes back on their feet.
- 01:23:42 I assume this is of great interest to the city and I assume that also conflicts with the community's interest because he has added interests and added connections with the city that is making him have an unfair advantage to our little community that has no city connections.
- 01:24:08 Also, I'm still not clear, since a hearing has to be held by law when there is significant health and environmental concerns, I haven't heard, what are those significant health and environmental concerns that has brought DEQ to us today. And I will also add it's not DEQ, it's Metro. If Metro's stated policy, is one of them to protect the natural resources, I do not see how building a waste site within a quarter mile of the Columbia slough is protecting the natural resources of metro. That's it.

Audrey O'Brien: Thank you for your comments. Next is Debbie Holmstedt.

- 01:25:05 Debbie Holmstedt: Hi, I'm sorry we didn't get this in the mail. So I wasn't sure the format but I wanted to address its point to waste removal. It says the permitting must remove all waste from the facility at least as often as necessary to prevent malodors, unsightliness, attraction of vectors or other environmental concerns. So to me, that says there will be no malodors, no unsightliness, no attraction of vectors including rats or any other environmental concerns that have already been mentioned.
- 01:25:40 As far as going into the slough, the water, et cetera and I'm concerned about the devaluation of our property with this. I'm not sure. I can't ask a question but I'm not sure if another site, perhaps west of the airport where the wind would not carry any odors that might happen, if that's been considered. And I agree with what other people are saying as well.
- Audrey O'Brien: Thank you for your comment. Janet Johnson.
- 01:26:25 Janet Johnson: Hi, I'm Janet Johnson and I have some concerns that I want to make sure that you know about. Several of them I think we've been talking about here. First of all, I don't think some questions are being answered and not everyone is here to answer the questions. People here want to know about the traffic concern. That's very, very important to all of us in this room. And I feel like I really haven't gotten those questions answered. I am very concerned about the trains and the trains going through there.
- 01:26:58 But just because you have one problem doesn't mean it's okay to compound it with another situation. Because I'm very concerned if anything is going in through Sandy Boulevard and going across those train tracks that we are looking at a disaster. It wasn't that long ago, probably 20 years ago that there was someone, there was a train -- a semi and a train -- well, the semi, the guy was distracted on a cell phone and someone was hit and killed.
- 01:27:30 And if that happened with the wrong kind of stuff -- if we had a train full of oil, we would have a tragedy of amazing proportions in our neighborhood. And we have talked about that. We haven't talked a lot about -- it was brought up about the Columbia slough just right here. We have just spent the past year they're doing all sorts of stuff because they want to protect the well water and so it doesn't make sense that that's going on.
- 01:28:04 And I don't think it makes sense that the oil is going on, on the trains either. And so I think that those are big concerns. And I'd like to see DEQ really look

at this whole thing that's going on. You know the odor is bad. The rats will be bad. I'd like to see different things done on that. But I think we need to look at the whole potential of having a very serious accident that could happen in this place. And, you know, when we're not getting all the answers, when we don't really know how different times 'cause no one really answered the questions that I asked about what time of day is this going on.

01:28:45 Is this going on all night long? Are we going to be woken up all night long with trains going -- excuse me, with semis in between the trains? You know, there's all sorts of things that could be going on and I don't feel we have valid representation here, that we're getting the answers to the questions. But with environment, there's so much to environment that concerns me that we already have problems with the trains.

01:29:13 I don't think adding another problem -- I think having it and how it's been working as a dry waste, that's worked out. But even if they're turning in from Sandy Boulevard, we need to look at that. If they're turning from Sandy, how are they going to turn left into that place when there's cars and everything? It's going to be another disaster. And I don't want to see lots of car accidents. I don't want to see bus accidents. I don't want to see those kind of things happens because we're not taking care of everything. So those are my comments.

Audrey O'Brien: Thank you. Bradley Stalding.

01:30:58` Bradley Stalding: Yes, I'm Bradley Stalding. I live Parkway Gardens apartment complex for the last 33 years. [indistinct] My concerns and [indistinct] smell the recycling plant [indistinct], the noise [indistinct], large machinery, they increase traffic on Sandy Boulevard [indistinct].

01:30:34 The close proximity to housing, yes, [indistinct] but prior to being Light and Industrial it was called the Bottoms and it was all farmland. [indistinct] Seepage of waste products into the soil, the Columbia River and the waste in the water [indistinct] for years. Destroying the environment. The hours of operation. Will it be 24 hours a day and if so, will I hear clanging of equipment at 4:00 in the morning? Sorry, that was a question. Didn't mean to do that. And another concern, there's really no buffer zone except the railroad tracks between where I live [indistinct]. Thank you.

Audrey O'Brien: Thank you. I'm sorry, I might say this wrong: Doyle Stiles. Was I close?

- 01:32:01 Doyle Stiles: Yes, as if I were Irish. First off, I'd actually like to thank the Simpson Family for the foresight of seeing that waste is something that needs to be dealt with and can be dealt with in a positive manner. But Hila mentioned earlier that -- she said that the City of Roses has complied with all the requirements. However, [indistinct] I think the City of Portland of land use hearing report and I believe is available on the DEQ site as a PDF.
- 01:32:39 And it mentions here on page three, waste-related uses are subject to the waste-related use to the open standards in 33.254.080, which requires a 100-foot setback from all property lines, from the property line to the facility as well as fenced and landscaping within that setback. Now, this property does not have those setbacks. This property is not allowed to put a fence on the east side because the east side of their property is the [indistinct] that is the [indistinct] the Columbia.
- 01:33:16 So in this statement, they have reduced the southern setback, the setback that is closest to populated areas by 90 percent to a ten-foot setback. The west property line has been reduced 62 percent to a 38-foot setback and the eastern property line has been reduced 60 percent to a 40-foot setback. Now I'm assuming that the DEQ gave them the allowance to put a waste facility here because they applied for a permit as a dry waste facility.
- 01:33:55 And so as a dry waste facility, all there's really going to be is dust. Now that they have the facility on the lot not approved for a waste facility, they're changing it to a wet waste facility. And I'm not saying that their efforts are not to be commended, I think it's the wrong facility. One of the things in the report is that it mentions that the impact area of a site is considered to be 600 feet from the property line.
- 01:34:29 Now, there's mention of residential areas and, it says in the report, some commercial. It doesn't mention that in these commercial areas within this 600-foot radius, everything that's pink is a restaurant. They sell and prepare foods. We've got a taco cart, we've got a Chinese restaurant, a Thai restaurant, we've got Venture Inn, we have Sandy Hot Wings, and there's even a couple of convenience marts, also sell and prepare food. But these are restaurants in the area.
- 01:35:09 And Bradley's home is also in this red circle. But if you read the report, you don't see anything mentioned about restaurants. And that just seems like a glaring omission and a bit of an intentional omission. Another point, [mutters]

to self] the representatives of the facility, it seems to me they've presented some contradictory information.

01:35:53 It says in the land use report that no wet waste will be stored onsite then later it says, well, some will be stored overnight. It says that all wet waste and all trucks that transport wet waste will be sealed but then later in the report it says that their trucks are equipped with automatic tarping systems. To me, a tarp over a truck does not mean a sealed truck.

01:36:23 In the hearing report, it is mentioned that the property owners have already neglected the properties to the point that the PBOT engineer, and this is in quotes, "the PBOT engineer noticed that vegetation on the subject property near the entrance on 138th is overgrown and encroaching into the public right of way creating potential visibility problems." This is the driveway on the flag lot where they're going to be bringing in trucks to transport their wet waste and it's already been mentioned the very heavily trafficked 138th Avenue.

01:36:57 The neighboring company right next door testified in the land use hearing that the existing facility already creates, in quotes, "a significant amount of airborne dust that is migrating beyond the boundaries of the subject property." So their existing facilities are already impacting their neighbors. So those are my points.

01:37:27 We have a waste facility on the site that is not approved for a waste facility. There's been permissions, for some reason, to allow a waste facility on this site but now they're modifying it to a more [indistinct] waste facility that doesn't meet the initial parameters. And I just wonder who's -- [mutters to self]. I've lost my train of thought. I think I'll end it there.

Audrey O'Brien: Thank you. Next is Emily Doumerc.

01:38:26 Emily Doumerc: Emily Doumerc. I came here tonight primarily concerned that the largest impact of this facility would be on the poor and more marginalized numbers of our neighborhood and our community. I wanted to thank the Simpson Family because it does seem clear to me from your testimony tonight that that is a primary concern of yours as well.

01:38:57 And I'm grateful that a large business such as yours in our community is taking into consideration the demographics of where we live and those that are most marginalized here. So thank you for the work that you're already

doing in our community to bring those in most need support and a leg up. I also wanted to thank Mr. Simpson, Sr. for your foresight in addressing waste and coming -- going into that business.

01:39:39 It's something that I think our society at large would like to just ignore once we close our garbage bin. And it's something that is going to have a lasting impact on our children. And so getting ahead is going to address some of those things here at home and not just ship all our waste over to other countries that have lesser pollutions and passing off our unwanted items to other communities.

01:40:16 I wanted to thank you for stepping into that arena. I did have concerns about the stated health -- I also got the postcard that said that there was potential health and environmental impacts. And I did not hear tonight what those potential health impacts could be. I am concerned about the potential effect on the Columbia and the Columbia River Slough as it is already an impacted zone from other environmental concerns.

01:40:55 And I'm hoping that this is not going to also contribute to the problems that already exist. I also wanted to, again, this has been said a lot and I know that your company is not directly responsible for this but as people mentioned, traffic is a problem in our neighborhood. I know a lot of people here [indistinct] and we're already dealing with increased traffic from the apartments that were recently built.

01:41:29 And so I know that for a lot of us, it can feel like it's coming from all sides, that we're literally pinned in by traffic in our neighborhood. And that is a concern. That's all that I had for my comments. Thank you.

Audrey O'Brien: Thank you. I've called up everyone who signed up to give verbal comments on our sign in sheet. Is there anyone else who would like to give verbal comments to DEQ at this time? Please come on up.

01:42:10 Phillip Dean: My name's Phillip Dean. I've been a [indistinct] for 30 years. I just have a few comments. [indistinct] will be the fourth recycling center within four miles of my house. We have the one up on [indistinct] and 122nd. All of the recycling on Marine Drive, which is [indistinct]. And we also have a recycling center on 128th and [indistinct]. And I'm just curious how this one is going to benefit our neighborhood.

- 01:42:44 You mentioned that the wet garbage site is 10,000 square feet. That's about the size of two blocks in our neighborhood. And you asked for 30,000 tons a year or excuse me, 30 trucks a day. And it seems to me that 30 trucks dumping garbage is going to far exceed 10,000 square feet.
- 01:43:17 On the other hand, I appreciate what you're doing 'cause, you know, garbage, it's like, you're going to throw it away, there is no away. It's got to go somewhere. And I'm concerned about this area becoming a sacrifice zone. That's all I have.
- Audrey O'Brien: Thank you. Anyone else?
- 01:43:50 Woman: I'm just concerned. I don't know if you brought up the Rydel. My cousin was part of that where it was going to be recycling and it was down on Columbia. And it was a beautiful facility. They had artwork and everything. And so they took over that whole neighborhood, up to Concordia all the way through. And it's industrial there but there were houses still around.
- 01:44:20 And when you drove past, it was unbelievable, the smell. And so I kind of looked up some different [indistinct] and once they're in, they're in. That one did go. And so it's, like, what happens if the smell is so overwhelming that it takes over the neighborhood like that one did? Is there a choice that we have of getting rid of it? And then the rat population.
- 01:44:51 And then also traffic. I don't know if any of you live in this area or around it but now they're making [indistinct] into a two-lane and Sandy's already a two-lane and it's hard to get home. It's unbelievable. And so it's like, why are you adding to what is already a congested area? And it just feels like everything is coming out this way and not giving us a little legroom, which would be nice.
- 01:45:28 Audrey O'Brien: Thank you. Anyone else? All right, I'm going to close the hearing now. It's 7:44 and turn the mic back over to Rob and I think there's time for a few more question.
- 01:45:46 Rob Nathan: Appreciate it. Thank you, Audrey and thank you everyone for being able to come up. I'm glad that we had enough time for everyone to participate in the formal hearing process and getting your comments on the record. We are open to taking feedback on this process. We really wanted to bring our two agencies together and bring this process together so you didn't have to come in two separate meetings. We do invite other government

agencies that are a part of the decision making process to the table to come to our meetings and not everyone took us up on that offer.

01:46:22 But we can talk to you about the things that we regulate and have jurisdiction over and I want to provide an opportunity for additional -- oh, also, I do have to say we have a hard stop at 8:00 because we contracted translation services and take care of folks and so to keep that fair, we do have a hard stop at 8:00. But we have about 15 more minutes where we can open up to additional questions about the metro license or the DEQ permit.

01:46:50 And we also have Alando and his father here to answer additional questions as well. So I want to give folks an opportunity to ask questions who have not been able to ask questions and folks who had secondary questions that we did not get to. Does anyone have any additional questions for us? Thank you, what's your name?

Sharon Mershon: Sharon Mershon. Thank you. Could you please give a brief summary of why this facility is needed?

Rob Nathan: That's a great question. DEQ or Metro, do you want to take that?

01:47:32 Hila Ritter: yeah, so, I mentioned earlier about our regional waste plan as [indistinct] document and what we're doing [indistinct]. And one of the tenets is that we want to support local businesses and family-owned businesses and allow them [indistinct] and Alando eluded to that. The solid waste system is a difficult market to get into as an entrepreneur. And one of the tenets of the regional waste plan is allowing opportunity for local businesses to participate in the system. That's what I can say for Metro.

01:48:10 Audrey O'Brien: What DEQ looks at as an application is can the applicant meet the requirements in our regulations. And this particular application demonstrated that. So then we proceeded with permitted.

Rob Nathan: And I want to remind folks, you heard a lot of comments and questions during the formal hearing. We are not responding to those specifically but those will be -- there will be a response to comments and questions made during the hearing available to folks.

01:48:41 Audrey O'Brien: I actually would like to respond to one question that came up. DEQ offers a hearing when we know there is public interest, not necessarily that there is an environmental concern that requires us to have a

hearing. So we knew there was significant interest in this facility and we wanted to go ahead and make sure that we gave you the opportunity to provide us with verbal comments.

01:49:10 We reviewed the application and we think all the environmental concerns can be addressed by how this facility proposes to operate and we have permit conditions in the permit to ensure that happens. So we didn't offer a hearing because of significant environmental concerns. We offered a hearing because we know people care very passionately about providing us with comments.

Rob Nathan: Enrique, do you know who's next?

01:49:45 Woman: A follow-up to the lady's question over there is that just by virtue of filling out all the right paperwork makes it appropriate that we need another facility just because the procedure was followed? That doesn't address the need, whether or not we as a community need it. I appreciate that I's have been dotted and the T's crossed but where's the need?

01:50:18 Hila Ritter: So another one of the things that the regional waste plan lays out for us is having - and I mentioned this earlier in my remarks - that we, as the overseers of the regional system, we are interested in having public/private, both operating the system. But I think that we would all agree that diversity makes the system stronger. And so having different kinds of facilities [indistinct] operate in different ways and provide different services makes our solid waste system stronger for the whole region.

01:51:53 Rob Nathan: I'll also add - this is someone who purchased [indistinct] regional waste plant and it was a three-year engagement with community, listening to community's concerns and issues around solid waste management. And so some of the priorities for the original waste plant were not developed by us. They were developed by the folks that we serve in the metro region. Another thing that we were really interested in addressing in regional waste management was service equity across the region.

01:51:20 So currently, there are -- folks have to commute a long way to access transfer stations and then that garbage is then hauled from that transfer station out of the region. And so we're committed to creating service equity across the region where folks can access transfer facilities closely and have actually less commuting and produce less carbon across the region. And that's what they never really committed to.

01:51:53 Woman: I guess -- I'm a homeowner is [indistinct]. And I guess I just kind of feel like how much stuff do we have to take? We have airplanes. We have trains. We have freeways. We have recycling. We have so many things in our neighborhood and it just seems like there are neighborhoods in this city that don't have any of those things. To add more things to us as homeowners, as residents, as consumers, as people eating, breathing, drinking, how much are we supposed to take? It doesn't seem fair.

01:52:34 Rob Nathan: I completely understand as an environmental justice advocate your concerns. And I want to acknowledge in this moment right now that we may not be qualified to answer all of your concerns. One of the things, we do not regulate land use, metro. And so I would encourage you to take up some of those concerns with folks who do regulate land use. However, I think one of the reasons we have this conversation is so we can get some of these questions on the record.

01:53:04 And while we may not be able to answer all of these questions right now in that moment, I think Hila and my team will be committed to, you know, we're recording all the questions that we have here and we will be -- Hila, how will we be answering some of those questions on the record beyond this evening?

01:53:24 Hila Ritter: That's a great point. So we will have the staff report that is going to be presented to the Metro Council, which I spoke about earlier that's essentially the recommendation that will have information about the public comment period and about this meeting and the conversation that we had here and the concerns that [indistinct]. So all of that information will be reflected in our staff report. Audrey or Jeremy?

Audrey O'Brien: As I said when we had the hearing, we will take all the comments and we will respond to them and we'll make modifications in the permit as needed. And we'll be proceeding that way. I think there were a couple over there that might be more important to hear.

01:54:12 Woman: Question for Metro: as representatives for the people in this room, what would you do to try to stop this from coming to our community? What would be your actions, the actions that you would suggest within Metro as our representatives to stop this?

Rob Nathan: You're saying to prevent City of Roses from getting a license to take wet waste? 'Cause they are already currently [indistinct] Okay, just making sure.

01:54:44 Hila Ritter: Yeah, I don't know how to address that because similar to what Audrey explained, you know, we have -- when we receive an application, we have a set criteria that we measure it against. And that's how we make or determine a recommendation. I can't -- I'm sorry, I can't advise you on advocacy.

Woman: So there's nothing from the citizen side to fill out that is equivalent to the business owner permit side?

Hila Ritter: Not to my knowledge. No.

01:55:19 Warren Johnson: I'm Warren Johnson. So this matter will come before the metro council. They are your elected officials. And you have the opportunity to actually talk to the officials. You can email your elected metro councilor. You could actually attend -- there will be a public hearing. The council will hear the ordinance, the staff will make the recommendation to council. It will be part of the ordinance, which is a public hearing. There will be the first hearing on May 9 and then at that first meeting, you have an opportunity to speak to the council in the public hearing.

01:55:51 The council can hear your concerns directly and then the council will take that information in. And the council will then make a decision to follow the [indistinct]. They'll have time to actually hear what you have to say. They'll have time to consider what you say before they actually determine whether they'll approve it or not. And that's at the second meeting. That's the following week they'll actually vote on the ordinance to decide this.

Woman: So May 9 is our next opportunity to have our voices be heard.

Warren Johnson: Absolutely. You can also email your councilor or just attend and actually give public testimony at that meeting if you like.

Woman: And where do I find that information where that hearing is at?

01:56:26 Warren Johnson: Yeah, it's at the Metro Regional Center. But on Metro's webpage there is a list of the Metro Council rules. They will tell you that they happen on Thursdays at 2:00. But the Metro Council meetings are posted on

the council's page on the Metro webpage and it will give you the agenda and it'll tell you the items and the order of the items that will be available and the time -- a rough estimate of when that ordinance will come up for council.

Woman: Okay. So Metro regional website will give me the information.

01:56:57 Warren Johnson: Absolutely. We also have information. You can reach out to Hila or me and then we'll make sure we get that information to you.

Woman: Thank you.

Warren Johnson: You're welcome.

Hila Ritter: Thank you. That was much better so thank you, Warren.

Woman: I also want to thank the company that is interested in doing this. I really appreciate your vision and everything. I would think that you would want to also be for the neighborhood that you go into. The traffic is a huge concern. It's been brought up multiple times.

01:57:27 And also, are there any other locations that have been looked at because traffic is awful. I mean, people in Oregon -- it's crazy up here. The drivers are crazy. And we're tired in [indistinct]. We feel like we're getting dumped on for a lot of things that nobody else wants in their community. And so I'm not against this company doing [indistinct]. Maybe there's another site that would be more appropriate than our neighborhood.

01:58:07 Rob Nathan: So your question was about why was this site located?

Woman: Yeah. Is there any choice that [indistinct] putting it somewhere else?

Rob Nathan: So we respond to a license application. But I'm going to let Alando answer that question.

Alando Simpson: Not the site has not been approved for waste-related activity per the codes under the City of Portland's land use requirements. That is the purpose of this process.

01:58:38 But there already was a public process for the city land use process. And that was back last fall. And as I indicated before, a lot of these concerns had already been addressed and were conditions of approval based on that land

use process. They indicated you had to do a, b, c, d, e, f, g otherwise you have an approval for this use even though this is an industrialized site. As it relates to -- you know, this is actually a perfect conversation, sorry Hila. But can someone just tell me a day when traffic got bad out here?

01:59:21 Woman: Years ago.

Alando Simpson: Years ago. Like, ten years? Five years? 20 years?

Woman: I've been here 52 years. I've seen it all.

Alando Simpson: Okay, so the previous operator, which was a [indistinct], an unregulated facility at that time, which means it was pretty bad. They did double the volume of what we're proposing, which means double traffic, right?

Woman: Where were they located?

Alando Simpson: Exact same site we're talking about.

Woman: On your land that you have?

01:59:55 Alando Simpson: Exactly. It was called Oregon Recycling Systems. That's just for context. But as far as that's concerned, traffic, this is a bigger conversation. This goes back to housing. This goes back to jobs. This goes back to infrastructure. This goes back to what I mentioned earlier about this community strengthening its voice and being able to have a stronger voice in order to determine what takes place out here. There are so many other agencies that play into this. The state, the city, the county and all the other community-based organizations and the affordable housing institutions.

02:00:28 Congestion is only a result of people not having alternative transportation options. That's all that is. And so if there are alternative transportation options, it would minimize the congestion and minimize the contamination that has incurred as a result of that, all the emissions. And so as I'm kind of going off on a tangent here, yes, these are commercial trucks. We're not even going to be really looking at using Sandy Boulevard. A lot of it's going to be Marine and Airport way.

02:01:00 And furthermore, the operation of one of the trucks will be coming in when congestion has already died down. Congestion out here is going to be somewhere between 7 and 9. The first loads come in at about 10.

[indistinct]

Rob Nathan: So Hila's trying to take the mic from me for Q&A so we can do closing remarks. I did promise one more individual if they have a question they could ask it. I want to honor that.

02:01:43 Woman: [indistinct] -- Sandy Boulevard is a problem, the whole carbon footprint thing and all of that [indistinct]. You can't tell me that's okay. It's like, why is the congestion [indistinct]?

Rob Nathan: I just want to provide clarity to what I meant. So assume a garbage truck -- so just assume. I'm not saying this is a fact. And this is based on our engagement efforts on the regional waste plant. So assume a garbage truck is picking up garbage in your neighborhood, taking it to Northwest Portland's transfer station, and then that garbage then comes back through your neighborhood again to East Oregon.

02:02:27 So if that's the current system, if we were to move that transfer a little closer then there would actually be less -- the truck would be on the road less time and it would come through your neighborhood less times. And that was a conversation that we had during the regional waste plan. I'm not saying that. It's a part of this license. I just wanted to be really clear on me providing transparency about what community told us when we set the standards for that regional waste plant. I'm going to pass it on because it is 8:00 and we have contracted services that are coming to an end for this meeting. And I want to see if Hila had anything else she wanted to say.

02:03:09 Hila Ritter: Thanks, Rob. I just wanted to say, again, Warren already covered it but I wanted to make sure and let everybody know that we are holding our council meeting to address this topic and bring this franchise conversation to the Metro Council on May 9 at 2pm at Metro Regional Center. It's located at 600 Northeast Grand Avenue. So the website is up there and I have business cards. Feel free to contact me and Jeremy has information back on that back table over there. Do you want to say anything about next steps?

02:03:43 Audrey O'Brien: For DEQ's process, our next steps are to receive any written comments by April 11 at 5pm and then we'll be responding to comments modifying the permit if needed and then issuing the permit modification.

Hila Ritter: So thank you so much for being here tonight. Thank you for sharing your perspectives and your concerns with us. It is helpful to us. We would like to continue this conversation more but we have to clean up and leave. So thank you so much for being here and sharing with us.

02:04:15 Rob Nathan: And I'm always interested in taking feedback about the process. On your way out, if you want to fill out note cards and give us feedback on the process today, please do so.

[end of file]