

Promising Practices in Construction Workforce - City Comparison Chart

June 30, 2017

Program Elements	Seattle	Boston	Los Angeles	Portland	
1	Establishment Mechanism	2010 Priority Hire initiative 2012 Priority Hire pilot program 2015 Priority Hire Ordinance 2017 Executive Order Expansion	1983 City Ordinance Extended in 1985; amended in 2017	2001 CWA, negotiated by project 2008 Construction Careers Policy at the Community Redevelopment Agency – Los Angeles 2011 Ordinance 181520 – Public Infrastructure Stabilization Ordinance	1993 – Fair Contracting and Employment Initiative adopted by City Council. 1994 - City Ordinance 2012 - Resolution 36944 – Social Equity Contracting Strategy 2012 Administrative Rule
2	Funding Mechanism	City Budget City Procurement and Contracting Services has a budget of \$1.5 million.	City Budget	City Budget Construction Careers Policy originally appropriated \$800k for monitoring every three years	City Budget. Program does compliance for some other agencies under IGA: Prosper Portland, Housing Bureau, Portland Public Schools, Home Forward.
3	Program Staffing and FTE	2 FTE in 2016 (6 FTE in 2015, year of implementation) 2 FTE in 2016, including Strategic Advisor – Enforcement and Strategic Advisor – Ombudsman	Approx. 8 FTE 6 Compliance Officers, 2 Data-Entry Staff	1.0 FTE “Jobs Coordinator” required to designated by the prime contractor for every project – through pre-approved list of organization	6 + FTE Program Manager, 2 Procurement Assistants, 5 Compliance Specialists (3 dedicated to City Construction Bureaus and 2 dedicated to Outside clients)
4	Project Size	5 million dollars or more on public projects Public/private projects with 5 million or more in city funding	Any public development project Private development projects equal or greater to 50,000 ft	All projects in the 5-year Public Infrastructure Programs Series List – projects approved by board Exempt where funding source has provisions or rules that forbid PLA or Local Hire provisions	City construction projects estimated at \$200,000 and above Subcontracts at \$100,000 and above
5	Workforce Goals	Director of CPCS sets project specific requirements with the intent of achieving certain goals, including:	- 51% of total work hours of journey people and 51% of total work hours of apprentices	- 20% of the labor hours, per trade, are required to be worked by state-registered apprentices;	

Promising Practices in Construction Workforce - City Comparison Chart

June 30, 2017

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - 20% Labor Hours performed annually by Priority Workers - 15% - 20% of the contract Labor Hours performed by Apprentices. - Aspirational goals for women and people of color set by CPCS for each CWA project. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - in each trade must go to Boston residents. - 40% journey people - 40% of apprentices in each trade must go to people of color - 12% of the total work hours of journey people and 12% of the total work hours of apprentices in each trade must go to women 		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Goal is 18% minority and 9% female for apprentices and journey-workers. - Goals can vary by project if they have a CBA or other agreement. diversity/community involvement.
6	Actual Utilization	<p>2016 Report for 7 CWA Projects:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Workers from economically distressed zipcodes: 21% - All female workers: 26% - All workers of color: 12% - Apprentices: 15% - Female Apprentices: 32% - Apprentices of color: 47% 	<p>Report of the 185 projects in 2016: 155 public and 30 private:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Boston Residents: 29% - People of color: 32% - Female: 6% 		<p>Report of the 22 City projects awarded in FY 16-17:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Apprentice: 21% - Minority workers: 29% - Female: 10% <p>Report of the 38 City projects awarded in FY 15-16:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Minority workers: 17.1% - Female: 5.7%
7	Data Transparency	<p>Extensive information on workforce diversity on CWA projects. Each CWA project has an individual Workforce Diversity report. Annual Report includes reports disaggregated and aggregated data tables.</p> <p>Reports are run monthly.</p>	<p>Extensive information on web site, with real-time searchable disaggregated data reported on line by project and by contractor/sub-contractor.</p>		<p>Annual reports on web site with some good disaggregation of data, but no overall analysis.</p>
8	Oversight Method	<p>The Department of Finance and Administrative Services(FAS) through City Purchasing and Contracting Services (CPCS) sets project goals and monitors progress.</p>	<p>Boston Residents Jobs Policy (BRJP) office and the Boston Planning and Development Agency (BPDA)</p>	<p>Community Advisory Group – appointed by CRA/LA Chief Exec Off. Made up of reps of CBOs</p>	<p>Staff works with prime to get prime and subs to be in compliance. Encourages them to reach out to agencies for diverse workers and post jobs with WorkSource.</p>

Promising Practices in Construction Workforce - City Comparison Chart

June 30, 2017

		The Priority Hire Advisory Committee, appointed by the mayor, also monitors goals, analyzes data, and advises the Director of FAS.	both monitor projects in the City of Boston. All projects being monitored by BRJP or BPDA are subject to review by the Boston Employment Commission (BEC); 7 members appointed by the Mayor. Meets monthly in a public meeting.	Joint Administrative Committee – 5 person committee: CRQA/LA Chief Exec Off. Or designee, CRA/LA Regional Administrator, Developer or Contract, member of community advisory group; one union rep	Projects with CBA or other Agreement may have a committee. City had Mayor-appointed 7-member Equitable Contracting and Procurement Commission to review procurement including workforce, has since been dis-banded.
9	Non-Compliance Penalties	There are no current penalties but the City intends to set-up liquidated damages in 2017.	No penalties for missing goals \$300 fine per day for not following Best Efforts steps. Also can be precluded from award of municipal contracts or other sanctions incorporated into contracts. Fines, escrow funds and some community benefit funds from developers go to support job training.	Developer or prime contract pays liquidated damages equal to the average project wage for each hour the project fell short of the requirement Liquidated damages collected must be used for local hiring and construction job training efforts	\$250 per day may be assessed, for each day of lost training opportunities. Damages may also be assessed for not following hiring process outlined in requirements. Funds go into a pot to be distributed informally to fund workforce programs.
10	Community Involvement	The City contracts with 12 community organizations representing various communities included in Priority Hire.	Manager meets regularly with neighborhood and community groups, especially those serving people of color.	Community Advisory Group (meets quarterly the 1 st year, semi annually after that)	Staff work with construction bureaus to promote apprentice opportunities and career options in the trades to high school students in the Portland area. Staff attend variety of meetings and/or participate in committees, which engage community groups that serve both women and minorities.
11	Supporting Organizations /Projects	Construction Jobs Equity Coalition, Priority Hire Advisory Committee	Policy Group on Tradeswomen Issues, Boston Jobs Coalition, Community Labor United	Los Angeles Alliance for a New economy (LAANE)	Metropolitan Alliance for Workforce Equity

Promising Practices in Construction Workforce - City Comparison Chart

June 30, 2017

12	Placement, retention, job continuity efforts	<p>Focus on improving workplace culture, implementation of Green Dot to improve retention</p> <p>Union dispatches must call workers first from economically distressed zipcodes</p>	Has Jobs Bank run by BRJP staff that connects residents with City contractors.	<p>Under this policy they feel that the career ladder is served by having a local hiring and PLA - commits construction employers to use unions for referrals – some of this is based on the local facts of lack of graduation rates in the few open shop programs.</p> <p>Jobs Coordinator Position</p>	<p>Contractors may count graduates of apprenticeship programs for up to a year after they've graduated to encourage retention.</p> <p>City web site has contact information to pre-apprenticeship programs. Contractors must register with Bureau of Labor & Industries as registered training agents. Contractors to post job opportunities with WorkSource.</p>
13	Supply Side	<p>The City contracts with community organizations and construction pre-apprenticeship training programs</p> <p>Outreach database is used to track individuals who have been recruited but not yet entered field. Data is shared with several agencies and service providers reach out to individuals to address barriers.</p>		<p>Project Developer must hire an organization to act as 'Jobs Coordinator'. Pre-qualified list of organizations. Facilitate implementation of local hiring requirements with CBOs. Recruitment, preparation, placement, and troubleshooting workforce problems</p> <p>Craft Request Form – employer to union programs</p>	
14	Website	https://www.seattle.gov/city-purchasing-and-contracting	https://www.boston.gov/departments/economic-development/boston-residents-jobs-policy-construction-projects#forms-and-statistics	http://clkrep.lacity.org/onlinedocs/2008/08-0499_rpt_cra_2-21-08.pdf	https://www.portlandoregon.gov/briefs/42255?
15	Database	Certified Payroll Lcptracker – report monthly	Access		BizTrak (Access), moving to B2GNow