Exhibit E to Ordinance No. 14-1346B

www.oregonmetro.gov

CLIMATE SMART COMMUNITIES SCENARIOS PROJECT

Summary of recommended changes

Recommended changes in response to comments received from Sept. 15 – Oct. 30, 2014 and during Nov. 7, 2014 MPAC/JPACT meeting

November 14, 2014

MAKING A GREAT PLACE

Metro

About Metro

Clean air and clean water do not stop at city limits or county lines. Neither does the need for jobs, a thriving economy, and sustainable transportation and living choices for people and businesses in the region. Voters have asked Metro to help with the challenges and opportunities that affect the 25 cities and three counties in the Portland metropolitan area.

A regional approach simply makes sense when it comes to providing services, operating venues and making decisions about how the region grows. Metro works with communities to support a resilient economy, keep nature close by and respond to a changing climate. Together we're making a great place, now and for generations to come.

Stay in touch with news, stories and things to do.

www.oregonmetro.gov/climatescenarios

Metro Council President

Tom Hughes

Metro Councilors
Shirley Craddick, District 1
Carlotta Collette, District 2
Craig Dirksen, District 3
Kathryn Harrington, District 4
Sam Chase, District 5
Bob Stacey, District 6

Auditor
Suzanne Flynn

Climate Smart Communities Scenarios Project

Summary of Recommended Changes

(comments received Sept. 15 through Oct. 30, 2014 and Nov. 7 MPAC/JPACT meeting)

The public review drafts of the Climate Smart Communities Strategy (Exhibit A), Regional Framework Plan Amendments (Exhibit B), Toolbox of Possible Actions (2015-20) (Exhibit C) and Performance Monitoring Approach (Exhibit D) were released for final public review from Sept. 15 to Oct. 30, 2014. The Short List of Actions for 2015 and 2016 (Exhibit F) was developed from Exhibit C by TPAC and MTAC for consideration by MPAC, JPACT and the Metro Council.

Metro's technical and policy advisory committees discussed and identified potential refinements to the public review materials at their October and November meetings. Public agencies, advocacy groups and members of the public submitted comments in writing, through Metro's website and in testimony provided at a public hearing held by the Metro Council on Oct. 30, 2014.

This document summarizes recommended changes to respond to all substantive comments received during the comment period. New wording is shown in **bold underline**; deleted words are ~~**bold crossed out**~~. Wording in unbolded underline text was included in the public review drafts of each exhibit. Amendments identified below will be reflected in Exhibits A-D to Ordinance No. 14-1346B.

Comments On the Climate Smart Strategy (Exhibit A)

#	Exhibit	Comment	Source(s)	Date	Staff recommendation
1	**Climate Smart Strategy (Exhibit A)**	Add a description of the Statewide Transportation Strategy and state fleet and technology assumptions included in the Climate Smart Strategy in the document to provide broader context of the relationship of the Climate Smart Strategy to state actions.	Angus Duncan, Drive Oregon	10/2/14, 10/28/14	*Amend Exhibit A as requested to add a description of the Statewide Transportation Strategy and state fleet and technology assumptions included in the Climate Smart Strategy.* In addition, the Toolbox of Possible Actions identifies specific actions that the state, Metro, local government and special districts are encouraged to take to support Oregon's transition to cleaner, low carbon fuels, more fuel-effiicient vehicles and transit fleet upgrades.
2	**Climate Smart Strategy (Exhibit A)**	Support state efforts to transition to cleaner, low carbon fuels, more fuel-effiicient vehicles and transit fleet upgrades.	Oregon Health Authority	10/7/14	
3	**Climate Smart Strategy (Exhibit A)**	Support active transportation and transit levels of investment, but deprioritize road widening and highways projects given the relative low greenhouse gas emissions reduction. Recommending $20.8 billion of spending on road projects likely overstates the regions real road funding priority, which is fixing and maintaining existing roads, not building new or expanded roads and highways.	BTA and 45 community members	10/21-10/30/14	*No change recommended to Exhibit. See also recommendation for Comment #15 in Exhibit B comments section.* Comments 3 and 4 have been forward to the Regional Transportation Plan (RTP) project team. The next scheduled update to the RTP will provide the forum for reviewing the plan's investment priorities within the context of updated financial assumptions, a new growth forecast, updated ODOT, TriMet and local TSP priorities, new policy guidance from the state or federal level, and the more comprehensive set of outcomes the RTP is working to achieve.
4	**Climate Smart Strategy (Exhibit A)**	Prioritize expanding transit and providing travel information and incentives to reduce VMT and encourage active modes.	Oregon Health Authority	10/7/14	

#	Exhibit	Comment	Source(s)	Date	Staff recommendation
5	**Climate Smart Strategy (Exhibit A)**	Rather than a blanket statement of prioritizing transit, local governments within transportation corridors needs to prioritize improvements. While transit may be a priority where there is a complete road network, in other locations completing road connections may be a prerequisite to transit. Simply stating that transit is a funding priority is too simplistic given the diversity and complexity of the region.	City of Hillsboro	10/30/14	
6	**Climate Smart Strategy (Exhibit A)**	Adding High Capacity Transit (HCT) in Tigard will NOT significantly reduce congestion now or in the future.	John Smith	9/19/14	*No change recommended to Exhibit A .* This comment has been forwarded to the Southwest Corridor project team for consideration in the planning process currently underway. SW Corridor Study recommendations will be incorporated in the Regional Transportation Plan.
7	**Climate Smart Strategy (Exhibit A)**	20% by 2035 is ridiculous too slow. We should be doing 20% by 2015. The Germans have reduced their emissions by 25%. The planet is cooking. By 2035, will we even be here? How can we speed this up? Set higher reductions.	Karen Davis	9/19/14	*No change recommended to Exhibit A.* The Climate Smart Strategy, when implemented, will result in a 29% reduction by 2035.
8	**Climate Smart Strategy (Exhibit A)**	Adopt and implement investments and strategies that reduce per capita VMT from 130 to less than 107 miles per week.	Oregon Health Authority	10/7/14	*No change needed to Exhibit A.* The Climate Smart Strategy as proposed is expected to achieve these VMT per capita reductions when implemented.
9	**Climate Smart Strategy (Exhibit A)**	Protect communities who live, work and attend school near highways and major roads through siting, design and/or mechanical systems that reduce indoor pollution.	Oregon Health Authority	10/7/14	*No change recommended to Exhibit A. This comment has been forwarded to RTP project staff for consideration in the next scheduled plan update.* While this is an important issue that needs to be addressed, policies and best practices should be developed through other efforts such as the Regional Transportation Plan. Noise pollution is another related issue.

#	Exhibit	Comment	Source(s)	Date	Staff recommendation
10	**Climate Smart Strategy (Exhibit A)**	Commuter rail between Salem and Portland is needed; existing vanpools are not frequent enough and get stuck in traffic.	Mike DeBlasi	10/16/14	*No change recommended to Exhibit A.* This strategy is idientified in the Toolbox of Possible Actions (Exhibit B). The 2014 RTP and Oregon Statewide Transportation Strategy (STS) includes a policy to support expanded commuter rail and intercity transit service to neighboring communities. Analysis completed in 2010 as part of the High Capacity Transit (HCT) plan showed the Portland to Salem/Keizer area as the most promising of the commuter rail corridors evaluated. Responding to House Bill 2408, ODOT and other partners are currently developing proposals to improve the speed, frequncy and reliability of passenger rail service in this corridor and beyond. Improvements are anticipated in the 2017-2020 time period. More information can be found at http://www.oregonpassengerrail.org
11	**Climate Smart Strategy (Exhibit A)**	Find opportunities to add references on the need to prepare for and adapt to the changing climate and begin work to address climate preparation at a regional level building on the Climate Smart Communities work and other work completed by the City of Portland and Multnomah County, which can be found at: www.portlandoregon.gov/bps/64079	Urban Greenspaces Institute, Coalition for A Livable Future, Citizen's Climate Lobby	10/27/14, 10/30/14, 10/30/14	*Amend Exhibit A as follows:* Include references on the expected climate impacts in Oregon and the need for both mitigation and adaption strategies. In addition, updates to Metro's Best Practices in Street Design handbooks in 2015 and the next RTP update present opportunities to further address climate preparation as it relates to transportation infrastructure. Staff will begin scoping the work plan for the next scheduled update to the RTP in 2015. The update is expected to occur over multiple years in order to address federal and state planning requirements and policy considerations and engagement recommendations identified through the Climate Smart Communities effort and the 2014 RTP update.

#	Exhibit	Comment	Source(s)	Date	Staff recommendation
12	**Climate Smart Strategy (Exhibit A)**	Assure the Climate Smart Communities Strategy provides opportunity to experiment and innovate with local or supplemental transit service, such as the GroveLink service in Forest Grove.	Clackmas County Board of Commissioners	10/22/14	*Amend Exhibit A as follows:* Clarify the transit element allows for local or supplemental service such as the South Metro Area Regional Transit (SMART) district and the GroveLink service in Forest Grove to complement regional transit service. In this example, Ride Connection partnered with TriMet and the city of Forest Grove to operate this supplemental local service. The service need was identified through TriMet's Westside Service Enhancement Plan effort and past planning by the City of Forest Grove. TriMet will continue working with local governments, businesses and other partners to develop a SEP for other parts of the regionthat identify and prioritize opportunities to improve bus service as well as pedestrian and bike access to transit. SEP recommendations will be addressed as part of the next update to the RTP. More information about the SEPs can be found at future.trimet.org
13	**Climate Smart Strategy (Exhibit A)**	The Climate Smart Strategy, Toolbox, Performance Monitoring and Early actions should all be aligned to prioritize investments in transit and active transportation. These investments will have the greatest greenhouse gas emissions reductions, provide multiple social, environmental and economic benefits and have strong public support.	Transportation Justice Alliance	10/30/14	*No change recommended to Exhibits A, B, C and D.* While the analysis and other national research show these investments do have the greatest greenhouse gas emissions reduction potential, provide multiple benefits and have strong public support, addressing climate change is one of six desired outcomes the region is working to achieve. The six desired outcomes are: economic prosperity, vibrant communities, safe and reliable transportation, equity, clean air and water and leadership on climate change. Therefore, the strategy, toolbox, performance monitoring and early actions include a balanced approach that implements adopted local and regional plans, and provides for locally-tailored implementation approaches.

#	Exhibit	Comment	Source(s)	Date	Staff recommendation
14	**Climate Smart Strategy (Exhibit A)**	Maintain an emphasis on increased highway capacity as a method of reducing greenhouse gas emissions and ensure the region has the ability to continue investing in highway capacity	Clackamas County Board of Commissioners, City of Happy Valley	10/22/14, 10/30/14	*No change recommended to Exhibit A.* Increasing highway capacity alone to reduce congestion (and related greenhouse gas emissions) does not have a lasting impact on reducing greenhouse gas emissions due to advancements in fleet and technology (e.g., low carbon fuels, electric and plug-inhybrid electric vehicles) and the unintended effect of inducing additional vehicle miles traveled (called latent demand). This effect was shown in the CSC results and has been well documented through national research. More information can be found at http://www.sightline.org/wp-content/uploads/downloads/2012/02/analysis-ghg-roads.pdf and www.arb.ca.gov/cc/sb375/policies/hwycapacity/highway_capacity_brief.pdf. The Climate Smart Strategy includes priority street and highway investments adopted in local plans and the Financially Constrained 2014 Regional Transportation Plan (RTP) as part of a balanced approach to support vibrant communities and economic prosperity and planned development in the region's centers, corridors and employment areas.
15	**Climate Smart Strategy (Exhibit A)**	Funding of the strategy needs more explanation to ensure the project meets OAR 660-044-0040(2)(i) given that the strategy relies on new investments and funding sources to meet the target. It is important for the region to not over commit funding we do not have.	City of Hillsboro	10/30/14	*No change recommended to Exhibit A.* OAR 660-044-0040(2)(i) provides that “if the preferred scenario relies on new investments or funding sources to achieve the target,” then Metro shall “evaluate the feasibility of the new investments or funding sources.” The overall cost identified for the preferred scenario is $24 billion over 25 years, which is $5 billion less than the $29 billion in funding identified in the 2014 RTP. The $29 billion in funding identified in the 2014 RTP includes the same assumptions regarding funding sources that were adopted by JPACT and the Metro Council in 2010 for purposes of developing a funding target for the 2035 RTP. Therefore, these are not “new” funding sources, but are the same sources adopted by JPACT and the Metro Council in 2010, and again in 2014, for purposes of describing full RTP funding.

#	Exhibit	Comment	Source(s)	Date	Staff recommendation
16	**Climate Smart Strategy (Exhibit A)**	Concern that future funding will be directed by what supports Metro goals, not local goals Need a better roadmap of future funding discussions and who/how priorities will be determined if region is not able to secure funding needed to implement strategy Should not pursue new projects; focus on funding existing priorities	Mayor Tim Knapp, Cities of Clackamas County Dick Jones, Clackamas County Special Districts Jim Bernards, Clackamas County Commissioner	11/7/14	*This comment was addressed in part in the staff recommendation onComments # 3-5 in this section of Exhibit E.* *Based on the November 7 discussion, staff recommends amending Exhibit A to include a discussion on funding-related implementation*
17	**Climate Smart Strategy (Exhibit A)**	Remove greenhouse gas emissions reduction star ratings from document	Jim Bernards, Clackamas County Commissioner	11/7/14	*No change recommended to Exhibit A.* The generalized climate benefit ratings were developed to provide qualitative information for policymakers to consider when comparing the different strategies and investments under discussion. The ODOT model used for the Climate Smart Communities analysis (and that ODOT used for their Statewide Transportation Strategy) accounts for the synergies between the policy areas and other variables, including vehicle miles traveled (VMT), fuel consumption, fleet mix, vehicle technology as well as the location of future growth. The GreenSTEP model cannot definitively isolate the individual effects of each strategy. For this reason, the more generalized low, medium, high star ratings are the most defensible level of detail for comparing the relative GHG reduction benefit of different policy areas and provide important context for the Climate Smart Strategy. It is important to note that the ratings are consistent with national and academic research that has been completed by others, including the University of California. The UC research, in particular, was developed in partnership with the California Air Resources Board to inform similar GHG planning work being conducted by each of California's MPOs and reflects the most current research on this particular topic. Policy briefs are also available at: http://arb.ca.gov/cc/sb375/policies/policies.htm

#	Exhibit	Comment	Source(s)	Date	Staff recommendation
18	**Climate Smart Strategy (Exhibit A)**	Urban growth boundary assumptions (12,000 acres) included in the draft strategy seems overly large given the amount of time it has taken to make past expansions development-ready	Jeff Gudman, City of Lake Oswego	11/7/14	*No change to Exhibit A recommended.* This assumption was included in the 2035 growth distribution adopted by the Metro Council in 2012 by Ordinance No. 12-1292A and was used for purposes of analysis to serve as the land use assumptions to reflect "adopted local and regional land use plans." A footnote at the bottom of Page 10 of the staff report states "The adopted 2035 growth distribution reflects locally adopted comprehensive plans and zoning as of 2010 and assumes an estimated 12,000 acres of urban growth boundary expansion by 2035. Metro's assumption about UGB expansion is not intended as a land use decision authorizing an amendment through this ordinance. Instead, the assumption about UGB expansion is included for purposes of analysis to assure that UGB expansion – if subsequently adopted by Metro and approved by LCDC – would be consistent with regional efforts to reduce greenhouse gas emissions. Review of any UGB expansion will occur through the UGB Amendment process provided for by ORS 197.626(a) and OAR Chapter 660, Division 24.
19	**Climate Smart Strategy (Exhibit A)**	Strategy lacks commitment to addressing congestion and funding road projects as part of the region's greenhouse gas emissions reduction strategy	Paul Savas, Clackamas County Commissioner	11/7/14	*This is addressed in part in the staff recommendation on Comment #14 in this section of Exhibit E. Additional context on the region's approach to managing congestion is provided below in response to November 7 discussion.* Nearly 15 years ago the region conducted significant analysis that resulted in an update to the region's congestion policy as part of the 2000 Regional Transportation Plan update. After significant and lengthy policy discussions between MPAC and JPACT, the region agreed to a comprehensive, multi-prong approach to managing congestion that is still in place today. The approach includes all of the policies, investments and strategies recommended in the Climate Smart Strategy, including strategically adding capacity to the region's arterial streets and highways.

#	Exhibit	Comment	Source(s)	Date	Staff recommendation
					The region's congestion policy recognized, among other things, that the cost to try to eliminate congestion was more than the public is willing to pay for and that the impacts on communities and the environment were beyond what was deemed acceptable. There continues to be strong support for the mobility policy adopted at that time and it has since been adopted in state plans and policies. The region continues to focus on using ITS and other technologies to better manage roads for reliability, better street connectivity, building freeway overcrossings to improve community circulation, strategically addressing bottlenecks and expanding capacity to streets and highways, expanding transit, improving multi-modal safety and completing the region's bicycle and pedestrian networks. All of these types of investments are recommended as part of the Climate Smart Strategy, including nearly $21 billion to maintain and expand the existing arterial street and highway network, $12.4 billion for transit capital and service enhancements, $2 billion for active transportation and $400 million for system and demand management programs and investments to make the most of the existing transportation system.
20	**Climate Smart Strategy (Exhibit A)**	Add implementing local transportation system plans to toolbox and strategy	Paul Savas, Clackamas County Commissioner	11/7/14	*Amend toolbox(Exhibit B) as requested and amend Exhibit A to more clearly describe that local transportation system plans (and local land use plans) are components of the Climate Smart Strategy.* *See also recommendation on Comment #63 in the Exhibit C section.*

End of comments and recommended changes to Exhibit A

Staff Recommendation on Public Comments Received for TPAC and MTAC Review

#	Exhibit	Comment	Source(s)	Date	Staff recommendation
Comments on Regional Framework Plan Amendments (Exhibit B)					
1	**Regional Framework Plan Amendments (Exhibit B)**	Chapter 1, page 2, Objective 1.1.4 - revise to read "**Incent and** encourage elimination of unnecessary barriers to compact, mixed-use, pedestrian-friendly and transit-supportive development within Centers, Corridors, Station Communities and Main Streets."	Mayor Neeley, MPAC member	10/22/14	*Amend as requested.*
2	**Regional Framework Plan Amendments (Exhibit B)**	Chapter 1, page 2, Objective 1.1.4 - revise to read "Encourage elimination of unnecessary barriers to compact, mixed-use, pedestrian- **and bicycle-**friendly and transit-supportive development within Centers, Corridors, Station Communities and Main Streets." for consistency with 2014 RTP policy language.	Metro staff	10/22/14	*Amend as requested.*
3	**Regional Framework Plan Amendments (Exhibit B)**	Chapter 1, page 3, Objective 1.10.(c)(ii) - revise to read "Makes bicycling and walking **the most** convenient ~~and~~ safe **and enjoyable transportation choice for short trips**, encourages transit use and reduces auto dependence and related greenhouse gas emissions" for consistency with 2014 RTP policy language.	Metro staff	10/22/14	*Amend as requested.*
4	**Regional Framework Plan Amendments (Exhibit B)**	Chapter 1, page 3, Objective 1.10.(c)(iii) - revise to read "Provides access to neighborhood and community parks, trails, ~~and~~ walkways, **bikeways** and other recreation and cultural areas and public facilities" for consistency with 2014 RTP policy language.	Metro staff	10/22/14	*Amend as requested.*
5	**Regional Framework Plan Amendments (Exhibit B)**	Chapter 1, page 3, Objective 1.10.(c)(iii) - revise to read "Provides access to neighborhood and community parks, trails, **schools,** ~~and~~ walkways, and other recreation and cultural areas and public facilities" to acknowledge the importance of providing access to schools.	Ruth Adkins, MPAC member	10/22/14	*Amend as requested.*
6	**Regional Framework Plan Amendments (Exhibit B)**	Chapter 2, page 3, revise 6th bullet to read, "Provide access to more and better choices for travel in this region and serve special access needs for all people, including youth, ~~**elderly**~~, **seniors** and ~~**disabled**~~ people with disabilities **and low incomes.**" for consistency with 2014 RTP policy language.	Metro staff	10/22/14	*Amend as requested.*
7	**Regional Framework Plan Amendments (Exhibit B)**	Chapter 2, page 3, revise 10th bullet to read, "Make walking and bicycling **the most** ~~**safe and**~~ convenient, **safe and enjoyable transportation choices for short trips**." for consistency with 2014 RTP policy language.	Metro staff	10/22/14	*Amend as requested.*

#	Exhibit	Comment	Source(s)	Date	Staff recommendation
8	**Regional Framework Plan Amendments (Exhibit B)**	Chapter 2, page 3, revise 11th bullet to read, "Limit dependence on ~~**any single mode of**~~ **driving alone** travel ~~**and**~~ increase**ing** the use of transit, bicycling, walking, carpooling and vanpooling." to provide more clarity.	Metro staff	10/22/14	*Amend as requested.*
9	**Regional Framework Plan Amendments (Exhibit B)**	Chapter 2, page 4, revise objective 2.1 to read, "Provide for reliable and efficient multi-modal **local,** regional, interstate and intrastate travel and market area access through a seamless and well-connected system of throughways, arterial streets, freight services, transit services and bicycle and pedestrian facilities." to recognize importance of local travel and accessiblity.	Metro staff	10/22/14	*Amend as requested.*
10	**Regional Framework Plan Amendments (Exhibit B)**	Chapter 2, page 5, revise objective 3.3 to read, "Provide affordable and equitable access to travel choices and serve the needs of all people and businesses, including people with low income**s**, ~~**children**~~**youth**, ~~**elders**~~ **older adults** and people with disabilities, to connect with jobs, education, services, recreation, social and cultural activities." for consistency with 2014 RTP policy language.	Metro staff	10/22/14	*Amend as requested.*
11	**Regional Framework Plan Amendments (Exhibit B)**	Chapter 2, Page 8, Objective 11.1 - Delete last bullet on demonstrating leadership on climate change given it is repetitive with the goal statement.	MTAC	10/15/14	*Amend as requested.*
12	**Regional Framework Plan Amendments (Exhibit B)**	Chapter 2, Page 8, Objective 11.1 - Delete reference to “regional plans and functional plans adopted by the Metro Council for local governments” because this is already defined in Chapter 8 (Implementation) of the RFP.	MTAC	10/15/14	*Amend as requested.*
13	**Regional Framework Plan Amendments (Exhibit B)**	Chapter 2, • Page 8, Objective 11.1 - Add reference to alternative fuel vehicles and fueling stations as part of supporting Oregon’s transition to cleaner, low carbon fuels and more fuel efficient vehicle technologies.	MTAC	10/15/14	*Amend as requested.*
14	**Regional Framework Plan Amendments (Exhibit B)**	Chapter 2, Page 8, Objective 11.1 - Revise sub-bullet listed under 3rd bullet to read "Making ~~**biking**~~**bicycling** and walking the ~~safe~~**safest, most** ~~**and**~~ convenient **and enjoyable transportation choice for short trips** and for all ages and abilities by completing gaps **and addressing deficiencies** in the region’s **pedestrian and bicycle** networks ~~**of sidewalks and bike paths that connect people to their jobs, schools and other destinations**~~;" for consistency with 2014 RTP policy language.	Metro staff	10/22/14	*Amend as requested.*

#	Exhibit	Comment	Source(s)	Date	Staff recommendation
15	**Regional Framework Plan Amendments (Exhibit B)**	Chapter 2, Page 8, Objective 11.2 - Policy language should be more direct and aspirational about linkages between the policies that reduce greenhouse gas emissions and Metro funding, such as the Community Development Grant Program and Regional Flexible Fund Allocation (RFFA) process. Use GHG emissions reduction as a filter for awarding funding to demonstrate leadership on climate change.	Community leaders meeting, MTAC, 1000 Friends of Oregon	10/1/14, 10/15/14, 10/22/14	*No change to Exhibit B recommended. This comment has been forwarded to the Metro staff responsible for the Community Development Grant Program (CDPG) and Regional Flexible Fund Allocation (RFFA) processes.* Chapter 8 of the Framework Plan provides language linking policies and funding. Specifically Section 8.2.1 states that "In formulating the Regional Funding and Fiscal Policies, the following should be considered: (a) General regional funding and fiscal policies which support implementation of this Plan and related functional plans including but not limited to a policy requiring Metro, in approving or commenting on the expenditure of regional, state, and federal monies in the metropolitan area, to give priority to programs, projects and expenditures that support implementation if this Plan and related functional plans unless there are compelling reasons to do otherwise." Additionally, the Metropolitan Transportation Improvement Program 2015-18 Report states "Efforts currently being undertaken at the federal level and in the... region will become policy frameworks to provide direction for future cycles of the MTIP." Climate Smart Communities is identified as one of the policy frameworks and "The development of the next MTIP cycle will incorporate recommended strategies from the Climate Smart Communities project." JPACT and the Metro Council provide policy direction for prioritizing allocation of the federal flexible funds at the beginning of each RFFA cycle. The next CBDG cycle and RFFA cycle (and policy update) will begin in 2015.
16	**Regional Framework Plan Amendments (Exhibit B)**	Chapter 2, Page 9, Objective 11.2 – delete bullet with reference to the Oregon Modeling Steering Committee because this seems to be unnecessary detail for a policy document.	MTAC	10/15/14	*Amend as requested.*

#	Exhibit	Comment	Source(s)	Date	Staff recommendation
17	**Regional Framework Plan Amendments (Exhibit B)**	Chapter 2, Page 9, Objective 11.3 – add reference to Toolbox of Possible Actions in policy statement and delete sub-bullets listing examples of possible actions because the actions are voluntary and could appear to be defacto priorities or criteria for funding eligibility. In addition, the level of policy detail for Goal 11 is much greater than other Chapter 2 goals and objectives. Add language to the Regional Framework Plan amendments to more clearly articulate the ability to "locally tailor" implementation tools identified in the Toolbox of Possible Actions.	MTAC members, Clackamas County Board of Commissioners, City of Hillsboro, City of Happy Valley	10/15/14, 10/22/14, 10/30/14, 10/30/14	*See comment 18 and comment 19 in this section for recommended changes.* For context, Chapter 2 of the Framework Plan reflects the goals and objectives included in Chapter 2 of the Regional Transportation Plan exactly, which provides less policy detail than other Framework Plan chapters. The 2018 RTP update presents an opportunity to update Chapter 2 of the Framework Plan to better match the level of policy detail contained in the other Framework Plan chapters. In addition, unless the Regional Framework Plan specifies that Metro require local governments to take a particular action, the RFP only directs Metro actions.
18	**Regional Framework Plan Amendments (Exhibit B)**	Chapter 2, Page 9, Objective 11.3 – add reference to safe routes to school programs to list of possible actions.	Ruth Adkins, MPAC member	10/22/14	*Amend as requested. See recommendation on Comment #21 in this section.*
19	**Regional Framework Plan Amendments (Exhibit B)**	Chapter 2, Page 9, Objective 11.3 – retain but shorten the list of example actions and revise the language to read, "Encourage local, state and federal governments and special districts to take actions recommended in the **Toolbox of Possible Actions**~~regional climate strategy~~ to help meet adopted targets for reducing greenhouse gas emissions from light vehicle travel, ~~including~~ **such as**…"	MPAC members	10/22/14	*Amend to read as follows:* "**Objective 11.10 Partner actions** Encourage local, state and federal governments and special districts to consider implementing actions recommended in the *Toolbox of Possible Actions* in locally tailored ways to help the region meet adopted targets for reducing greenhouse gas emissions from light vehicle travel, such as: **i.** implement plans and zoning that focus higher density, mixed-use zoning and development near transit. ii. complete gaps in pedestrian and bicycle access to transit. iii. implement capital improvements in frequent bus corridors (including dedicated bus lanes, stop/shelter improvements, and intersection priority treatments) to increase service performance. iv. adopt "complete streets" policies and designs to support all users. v. integrate multi-modal designs in road improvement and maintenance projects to support all users. vi. implement safe routes to school and transit programs. vii. prepare community inventory of public parking spaces and usage. viii. develop and implement local climate action plans."

#	Exhibit	Comment	Source(s)	Date	Staff recommendation
20	**Regional Framework Plan Amendments (Exhibit B)**	Chapter 7 (Management), page 8, to incorporate performance measures recommended to be tracked every two years as part of required reporting that responds to ORS 197.301. OAR 660-044-0040 requires that the preferred scenario include performance measures. The preferred scenario is to be adopted as part of the Regional Framework Plan, and, as a result, performance measures also need to be "adopted" as part of the Regional Framework Plan.	Metro staff in consultation with DLCD staff	10/23/14	*Amend as requested. See recommendation on comment #21 on Exhibit B in this section.* Performance measures recommended to be added to Section 7.8.4 are: vehicle miles traveled; motor vehicles, pedestrian and bicycle fatalities and serious injury crashes; transit revenue hours; transit ridership; access to transit; travel time reliability; and air quality. Other performance measures, including greenhouse gas emissions, are recommended to be reported as part of federally-required updates to the Regional Transportation Plan.
21	**Regional Framework Plan Amendments (Exhibit B)**	Delete Objective 11.4 in Exhibit B and add to Chapter 7 (Management), Page 8, to add new objective that reads "**Monitor the following performance measures for Chapter 1 and 2 of this Plan as part of scheduled updates to the Regional Transportation Plan: (a) light duty vehicle greenhouse gas emissions; (b) household transportation/housing cost burden; (c) registered light duty vehicles by fuel/energy source; (d) workforce participation in commuter programs; (e) household participation in individualized marketing programs; (f) bike and pedestrian travel; (g) bikeways, sidewalks and trails completed.**	Metro staff in consultation with DLCD staff	10/23/14	*Amend as requested. In addition amend policy 7.8.6 to read as follows:* 7.8.6 Take corrective actions if anticipated progress is found to be lacking or if Metro goal and policies need adjustment~~. in order to allow adjustments soon after any problem arices and so that relatively stable conditions can be maintained~~." Measures not currently monitored as part of federally-required RTP updates will be incorporated into the plan as part of the next scheduled update (due in 2018) in coordination with other performance measure updates needed to address federal MAP-21 requirements related to performance-based long-range transportation planning. In addition, this is a more appropriate location to direct monitoring and reporting on the progress of local and regional efforts to meet adopted targets for reducing greenhouse gas emissions.

#	Exhibit	Comment	Source(s)	Date	Staff recommendation
22	**Regional Framework Plan Amendments (Exhibit B)**	Chapter 2, Page 9, Objective 11.3 - require, rather than encourage, climate responsive actions listed.	Oregon American Planning Association	10/29/14	*No change recommended to Exhibit B.* Existing Metro functional plans, first adopted in 1996, already identify land use and transportation actions that local governments must implement that will help implement the Climate Smart Strategy. As noted, implementation of the Toolbox of Possible Actions does not mandate adoption of any particular policy or action and instead was developed with the recognition that existing city and county plans for creating great communities are the foundation for reaching the state target. Implementation actions in the toolbox are encouraged and allow local flexibility in how, when and where different actions may be applied, recognizing that some tools and actions may work better in some locations than others.
23	**Regional Framework Plan Amendments (Exhibit B)**	Chapter 1, larger issues of community design and jobs/housing balance appear unaddressed in the Regional Framework Plan. Opportunities for housing near job rich locations is important to reduce commute distances and demand on the region's roadways.	City of Wilsonville	10/30/14	*Amend Exhibit B, Chapter 1, page 10, Policy 1.10.1, as follows:* "iv) Reinforces nodal, mixed-use, neighborhood-oriented **community** design**s to provide walkable access to a mix of destinations to support meeting daily needs, such as jobs, education, shopping, services, transit and recreation, social and cultural activities.**"
24	**Regional Framework Plan Amendments (Exhibit B)**	Amend Framework Plan, Chapter 1, page 4, Policy 1.3.2(c) as follows: Allow affordable housing, particularly in Centers and Corridors and other areas well-served with public services **and frequent transit service**."	Staff recommendation on Comment #4 in Exhibit C section	10/30/14	*Amend as recommended.*
25	**Regional Framework Plan Amendments (Exhibit B)**	Too much detail included in the Chapter 2 Regional Framework Plan amendments, compared to existing goals and objectives Strike all toolbox related bullets listed in Chapter 2, Policy 11.3	Susie Lahsene, Port of Portland Paul Savas, Clackamas County Commissioner	11/7/14	*This is addressed in part in the staff recommendation on Comment #17-19 and 21 in this section of Exhibit E.* *Based on further consideration of MPAC and JPACT's Nov. 7 discussion, staff is prepared additional amendments to Chapter 2 (Transportation) of the Regional Framework Plan to list the key strategies of the Climate Smart Strategy, and possible Metro actions and partner actions as objectives. The changes are reflected in the updated Exhibit B (dated 11/14/14)*

#	Exhibit	Comment	Source(s)	Date	Staff recommendation
26	**Regional Framework Plan Amendments (Exhibit B)**	Policy language not strong enough on influence of land use on transportation and importance of jobs/housing balance as a greenhouse gas emissions reduction strategy	Mayor Tim Knapp, Cities of Clackamas County Mayor Doug Neeley, City of Oregon City	11/7/14	*This is addressed in part in the staff recommendation on Comment #23 in this section of Exhibit E as follows:* *Amend Exhibit B, Chapter 1, page 10, Policy 1.10.1, as follows:* "iv) Reinforces nodal, mixed-use, neighborhood-oriented **community** design**s to provide walkable access to a mix of destinations to support meeting daily needs, such as jobs, education, shopping, services, transit and recreation, social and cultural activities**." In addition, other Framework Plan policies currently address jobs/housing balance, including Chapter 1, Policy 1.4.2, that were not included in the public review document: "Balance the number and wage level of jobs within each subregion with housing cost and availability within that subregion. Strategies are to be coordinated with the planning and implementation activities of this element with Policy 1.3, Housing Choices and Opportunities and Policy 1.8, Developed Urban Land."
27	**Regional Framework Plan Amendments (Exhibit B)**	Language needs to call out incentivizing the kind of development needed to support implementation	Mayor Doug Neeley, City of Oregon City	11/7/14	*This is addressed in the recommendation on Comment #1 on in this section of Exhibit E.*
28	**Regional Framework Plan Amendments (Exhibit B)**	Amend Policy 1.7.5(a) and (d) of Chapter 1 of the Regional Framework Plan to reflect that planning for new urban areas can also help further the region's efforts in reducing greenhouse gas emissions: "a. Help achieve livable communities **and reduce greenhouse gas emissions**." "d. Determine the general urban land uses, **key local and regional multi-modal transportation facilities** and prospective components of the regional system of parks, natural areas..."	Metro staff	11/14/14	*Amend as requested. See recommendation on Comment #58 in the Exhibit C section of this document.*

#	Exhibit	Comment	Source(s)	Date	Staff recommendation
29	**Regional Framework Plan Amendments (Exhibit B)**		Metro staff	11/14/14	*Amend page 1 of Chapter 1 and Chapter 2 of the Regional Framework Plan to add the following sentence:* *"**The policies in this chapter are also a key component of the regional strategy to reduce per capita greenhouse gas emissions from light duty vehicles.**"* This change further clarifies that the existing (and amended) policies in this Plan are a key part of the region's strategy for meeting OAR 660-044.

End of comments and recommended changes to Exhibit B

Staff Recommendation on Public Comments Received for TPAC and MTAC Review

#	Exhibit	Comment	Source(s)	Date	Staff recommendation
		Comments on Toolbox of Possible Actions (Exhibit C)			
1	**Toolbox of Possible Actions (2015-20) (Exhibit C)**	Page 1, implement 2040 Growth Concept and local adopted plans, under Metro actions, add an action that calls out that 2018 RTP update will be a tool to implement the Climate Smart Strategy.	1000 Friends of Oregon	10/22/14	*Amend as requested.* This is also called out in the legislation adopting the Climate Smart Strategy.
2	**Toolbox of Possible Actions (2015-20) (Exhibit C)**	Page 1, implement 2040 Growth Concept and local adopted plans policy, revise language "Restore local control of housing policies and programs" to ensure that it's about achieving housing affordability, not just restoring local control. Be explicit about need for removal of statewide ban on inclusionary zoning.	Community leaders meeting, Oregon Environmental Council, 1000 Friends of Oregon, Coalition for a Livable Future, Transportation Justice Alliance	10/1/14, 10/15/14, 10/22/14, 10/30/14, 10/30/14	*Amend toolbox actions as follows:* "Restore local control of housing policies and programs to ensure ~~local~~ communities have a full range of tools available to meet the housing needs of all residents **and income levels** and expand opportunities for households of modest means to live closer to work, services and transit." This change will be reflected in Metro, local government and special district actions. In addition, Policy 1.3.5 in Chapter 1 of the Regional Framework Plan encourages local governments to consider a range of tools and strategies to achieve affordable housing goals, including a voluntary inclusionary zoning policy.
3	**Toolbox of Possible Actions (2015-20) (Exhibit C)**	Page 1, implement 2040 Growth Concept and local adopted plans policy, too broad of a spectrum of policies have been identified in some toolbox actions. The Climate Smart Strategy should not be used as a cure all for any perceived shortcomings in the land use regulatory system - for example connection to brownfield redevelopment and removal of statewide ban on inclusionary zoning.	City of Hillsboro	10/30/14	*No change to Exhibit C recommended.* Chapter 1 of Regional Framework Plan (Policy 1.3) includes these types of policies as ways to support implementing the 2040 Growth Concept - a key component of the Climate Smart Strategy. The toolbox actions identified are intended to support these existing policies and addresses implementation issues that have been consistently raised by community stakeholders throughout the Climate Smart Communities effort.

#	Exhibit	Comment	Source(s)	Date	Staff recommendation
4	**Toolbox of Possible Actions (2015-20) (Exhibit C)**	Page 1, implement 2040 Growth Concept and local adopted plans policy, under Metro actions, add new action to leverage Metro and the region's public investments to maintain and create affordable housing in transit-served areas.	1000 Friends of Oregon	10/22/14	Amend toolbox as follows: "**Leverage Metro and the region's public investments to maintain and create affordable housing options in areas served with frequent transit service."** Amend Framework Plan, Chapter 1, page 4, Policy 1.3.2(c) as follows: Allow affordable housing, particularly in Centers and Corridors and other areas well-served with public services **and frequent transit service.**" In addition, this comment has been forwarded to staff working on Powell-Division Transit Study and Metro's Equity Strategy and Equitable Development work programs to further address through that work. Recommendations from these efforts may lead to Regional Framework Plan additional amendments and will be addressed in the next federally-required RTP update.
5	**Toolbox of Possible Actions (2015-20) (Exhibit C)**	Page 1, implement 2040 Growth Concept and local adopted plans policy, under Metro actions, add new action to support increased funding for affordable housing, particularly along frequent transit lines.	Coalition for a Livable Future, Transportation Justice Alliance	10/30/14, 10/30/14	Amend as follows: "**Support increased funding for affordable housing, particularly along corridors with frequent transit service**."
6	**Toolbox of Possible Actions (2015-20) (Exhibit C)**	Page 1, implement 2040 Growth Concept and local adopted plans policy, under Metro actions, add new action "**Ensure major investments in transit and other community development projects are accompanied with policies that protect against economic displacement of lower-income residents**."	1000 Friends of Oregon	10/22/14	*No change to Exhibit C recommended. See also recommendation on Comment #11 in this section.* While this would address a significant implementation issue raised during the Climate Smart Communities effort, this comment has been forwarded to staff working on Powell-Division Transit Study and Metro's Equity Strategy and Equitable Development work programs to address. Recommendations from these efforts may lead to Regional Framework Plan amendments and will be further addressed in the next federally-required RTP update.
7	**Toolbox of Possible Actions (2015-20) (Exhibit C)**	Page 2, implement 2040 Growth Concept and local adopted plans policy, under Metro actions, add an action to implement the 2040 Growth Concept's Climate Smart Strategies in the 2018 RTP.	Safe Routes to School National Partnership	10/28/14	*Amend as requested as follows:* Add a new action that reads "**Implement the Climate Smart Communities Strategy in the 2018 RTP**."

Staff Recommendation on Public Comments Received for TPAC and MTAC Review

#	Exhibit	Comment	Source(s)	Date	Staff recommendation
8	**Toolbox of Possible Actions (2015-20) (Exhibit C)**	Page 2, implement 2040 Growth Concept and local adopted plans policy, under Metro actions, add an action to provide guidance to cities and counties on location of new schools, services, shopping and other health promoting resources and community destinations close to neighborhoods.	Safe Routes to School National Partnership	10/28/14	*No change recommended to Exhibit C.* A significant amount of best practices and other guidance is available related to the location of new schools, services, shopping and other health promoting resources and community destinations close to neighborhoods, such as Metro's Community Investment Toolkit series, publications prepared by Oregon's Transportation Growth Management program and federal agencies. See: www.oregon.gov/LCD/TGM/Pages/publications.aspx and www.epa.gov/smartgrowth/pdf/brochure_0906.pdf for more information.
9	**Toolbox of Possible Actions (2015-20) (Exhibit C)**	Page 1, implement 2040 Growth Concept and local adopted plans policy, under Metro actions, revise 2nd near-term bullet to read "Expand on-going technical assistance and grant funding to local governments, developers and others to **advance implementation of local land use plans, and** incorporate…"	Metro staff	10/24/14	*Amend as requested.*
10	**Toolbox of Possible Actions (2015-20) (Exhibit C)**	Page 2, transit policy, revise last sub-bullet under development of TriMet SEPs to read, "~~**Consider**~~ **Use** ridership demographics in service planning." This revision should be reflected in bullet under local government and special district actions.	Community leaders meeting and 1000 Friends of Oregon	10/1/14, 10/22/14	*Amend as requested.*
11	**Toolbox of Possible Actions (2015-20) (Exhibit C)**	Page 2, transit policy, under Metro actions, move "Research and develop best practices to support equitable growth and development…" to immediate time period.	Community leaders meeting, 1000 Friends of Oregon	10/1/14, 10/22/14	*Amend as requested.* Work is underway as part of the Powell-Division Transit Study and Metro's Equity Strategy and Equitable Development work programs. Recommendations from these efforts may lead to Regional Framework Plan amendments and will be addressed in the next federally-required RTP update.
12	**Toolbox of Possible Actions (2015-20) (Exhibit C)**	Page 2, transit policy, under Metro actions, immediate term, delete 2nd bullet "~~**Consider local funding mechanism(s) for local and regional transit service**~~." This is already listed under the first action.	City of Hillsboro	10/30/14	*Amend as requested.*
13	**Toolbox of Possible Actions (2015-20) (Exhibit C)**	Page 2, transit policy, under Metro actions, add an action to implement the transit actions in the Climate Smart Strategy in the 2018 RTP.	1000 Friends of Oregon, Safe Routes to School National Partnership	10/22/14, 10/28/14	*Amend as follows:* Add a new action that reads "**Implement the Climate Smart Communities Strategy transit investments and actions, including community and regional transit service plans, in the 2018 RTP**."

#	Exhibit	Comment	Source(s)	Date	Staff recommendation
14	**Toolbox of Possible Actions (2015-20) (Exhibit C)**	Convert school bus and transit fleets to electric and/or natural gas buses to reduce greenhouse gas emissions and youth exposure to diesel and other emissions from existing fleets.	Craig Stephens, City of Wilsonville	9/18/14, 10/30/14	*Amend page 2 of the toolbox of actions to list these as possible actions in the near-term.* The state mandated greenhouse gas emissions reduction target applies to vehicle weighing 10,000 pounds or less, which includes Type A-1 buses. While most SMART and TriMet buses weigh more than 10,000 pounds, the agencies are exploring and testing alternative fuel buses to assess fueling infrastructure needs and vehicle performance, maintenance and cost-effectiveness compared to the diesel buses it currently uses.
15	**Toolbox of Possible Actions (2015-20) (Exhibit C)**	Page 2, transit policy, add new actions: "**Fund reduced fare programs and service improvements for transit dependent communities such as youth, older adults, people with disabilities and low-income families**, **Expand and sustain Youth Pass program, including expanding routes and frequency along school corridors."**	Safe Routes to School National Partnership	10/28/14	*Amend existing toolbox language as follows:* "Fund reduced fare programs and service improvements for **transit dependent communities such as** youth, older adults, people with disabilities and low-income families." Add new special district action that reads, "**Expand and sustain Youth Pass program, including expanding routes and frequency along school corridors**."
16	**Toolbox of Possible Actions (2015-20) (Exhibit C)**	Page 2, transit policy, add the following new actions to recognize the emissions reductions can come from electric transit vehicles or other low carbon alternative fules: "**Support transit partners in seeking federal grant funds for electric buses**;" "**Seek increased state funding for electric buses**;" and **"Increased funding flexbility to allow for greater upfront capital spending on electric buses if those expenses are offset by operating savings**."	Drive Oregon, City of Wilsonville	10/28/14, 10/30/14	*Amend to add the following new actions given that some transit vehicles do weigh less than 10,000 pounds:* "**Support transit partners in seeking federal grant funds for electric and other low-carbon alternative fuel buses**;" "**Seek increased state funding for electric and other low-carbon alternative fuel buses**;" and "**Seek increased funding flexbility to allow for greater upfront capital spending on electric and other low-carbon alternative fuel buses if those expenses are offset by operating savings**."

#	Exhibit	Comment	Source(s)	Date	Staff recommendation
17	**Toolbox of Possible Actions (2015-20) (Exhibit C)**	Pages 3 and 4, expand bullets on using green street design to not only call out planting trees to support carbon sequestration and using materials that reduce infrastructure-related heat gain. Add reference to green street designs for capturing, absorbing and cleaning stormwater and making more use of pervious, rather than impervious, surface materials. These strategies will help the region save money and adapt to the unwelcome effects of climate change.	Oregon Environmental Council, Urban Greenspaces Instititute, Coalition for a Livable Future	10/15/14, 10/27/14, 10/30/14	*No change to Exhibit C recommended.* These benefits are important for the reasons stated. This comment has been forwarded to the Metro staff responsible for updating the region's best practices handbooks for street design with a recommendation to link the broader stormwater benefits of green street designs to climate adaptation strategies that will complement the greenhouse gas emissions reduction strategies identified through this project. The handbooks are scheduled to be updated in the 2015-16 time period. The update is listed as an immediate action in Exhibit C.
18	**Toolbox of Possible Actions (2015-20) (Exhibit C)**	Page 3, biking and walking policy, add new immediate action for local governments - "**Complete an inventory of sidewalk/bike lane gaps to help prioritize where limited funding could best be directed to encourage multi-modal movement.**"	City of Hillsboro	9/24/14	*Amend as follows:* "**Review community inventory of sidewalk and bike lane gaps and definiciencies to help prioritize where limited funding could best be directed to encourage multi-modal movement.** " The Transportation Planning Rule and and Regional Transportation Functional Plan already require local governments to complete an inventory of bicycle and pedestrian facilities as part of their adopted local transportation system plan.
19	**Toolbox of Possible Actions (2015-20) (Exhibit C)**	Page 3, biking and walking policy, under Metro actions, add an action to implement the bicycle and pedestrian actions in the Climate Smart Strategy in the 2018 RTP.	1000 Friends of Oregon	10/22/14	*Amend as requested as follows:* Add a new action that reads **"Implement the Climate Smart Communities Strategy active transportation investments and actions in the 2018 RTP**."
20	**Toolbox of Possible Actions (2015-20) (Exhibit C)**	Page 3, biking and walking policy, add new Metro action: "**Complete a region-wide active transportation needs assessment, including needs around schools and access to transit**."	National Safe Routes to School Partnership	10/28/14	*Amend as follows:* add Metro action (near term) that reads, "**Update the Regional Active Transportation Plan needs assessment in the 2018 RTP.**" add cities and counties action (near term) "**Conduct needs assessments for schools and access to transit during updates to TSPs and other plans**."

#	Exhibit	Comment	Source(s)	Date	Staff recommendation
21	**Toolbox of Possible Actions (2015-20) (Exhibit C)**	Page 3, biking and walking policy, add new Metro action: "**Build a diverse coalition working together to build and monitor local and state commitment to implement and fund the Regional Active Transportation Plan, including Safe Routes to Schools and Safe Routes to Transit**"	National Safe Routes to School Partnership	10/28/14	*Amend as follows, under Metro actions:* "**Build and monitor local and state commitment to implement the Active Transportation Plan, and Safe Routes to Schools and Safe Routes to Transit.**" Monitoring would occur through periodic updates to the Regional Transportation Plan. Funding active transportation is addressed in a separate action in the funding portion of the toolbox.
22	**Toolbox of Possible Actions (2015-20) (Exhibit C)**	Page 3, biking and walking policy, add new actions to recognize potential role of electric bikes in the future: "**Simplify and clarify policy on e-bike use of bike lanes and other infrastructure**;"**Clarify that e-bikes are part of the region's active transportation strategy**;" and "**Fund pilot project to test the efficacy of e-bikes in attracting new riders**."	Drive Oregon	10/28/14	*Amend as follows:* "**Simplify and clarify policy on e-bike use of bike lanes and other infrastructure**;"**Clarify that e-bikes are part of the region's active transportation strategy**;" and "**Partner with Portland State University to develop a pilot project to test the efficacy of e-bikes in attracting new riders.**"
23	**Toolbox of Possible Actions (2015-20) (Exhibit C)**	Page 3, biking and walking policy, under Metro actions, add an action to prioritize or commit regional flexible funds to active transportation.	1000 Friends of Oregon, John Carr, National Safe Routes to School Partnership, Coalition for a Livable Future	10/22/14, 10/27/14, 10/28/14, 10/30/14	*No change recommended to Exibit C. See also recommendation on Comment #15 in the Exhibit B section.* This comment has been forwarded to the Metro staff responsible for the Regional Flexible Fund Allocation (RFFA) process. JPACT and the Metro Council provide policy direction for prioritizing allocation of the federal flexible funds at the beginning of each RFFA cycle. The next RFFA cycle (and policy update) will begin in 2015.
24	**Toolbox of Possible Actions (2015-20) (Exhibit C)**	Page 3, biking and walking policy, under Metro actions, add an action to use the Climate Smart Strategy as a filter for evaluating individual transportation projects to construct or widen major roads and arterials.	1000 Friends of Oregon, National Safe Routes to School Partnership	10/22/14, 10/28/14	*No change recommended to Exhibit C. See also recommendation on Comment #15 in the Exhibit B section.* Metro does not apply a single filter to individual projects included in the Regional Transportation Plan, and most RTP projects are locally-funded and reflect locally adopted investment priorities. Adoption of the Climate Smart Strategy will incorporate reducing greenhouse gas emissions from light duty vehicles in system-level regional transportation planning and investment decisions.

#	Exhibit	Comment	Source(s)	Date	Staff recommendation
25	**Toolbox of Possible Actions (2015-20) (Exhibit C)**	Page 3, biking and walking policy, include the following actions to support increased physical activity: integrate multi-modal designs in road improvement and maintenance to support all users, implement complete streets strategies and complete the active transportation network.	Oregon Health Authority	10/7/14	*No change recommended to Exhibit C.* The draft toolbox currently identifies these actions.
26	**Toolbox of Possible Actions (2015-20) (Exhibit C)**	Page 4, streets and highways policy, under Metro actions, delete first bullet under "Build a diverse coalition" as ensuring adequate funding for local maintenance is a local responsibility, not a Metro responsibility.	City of Hillsboro	10/30/14	*Amend as requested. See also recommendation on Comment #12 in this section.* This amendment also applies to other references of local funding under Metro actions on Page 2, transit.
27	**Toolbox of Possible Actions (2015-20) (Exhibit C)**	Page 4, streets and highways policy, add "**Adopt a vision zero strategy to eliminate all traffic fatalitlies**" for each partner (e.g., state, Metro, local governments and special districts) to be consistent with reference in bike and pedestrian policy actions on page 3.	Community leaders meeting, Safe Routes to School Partnership	10/1/14, 10/28/14	*Amend as requested.*
28	**Toolbox of Possible Actions (2015-20) (Exhibit C)**	Page 4, streets and highways policy, page 5, use technology policy and provide travel information and incentives policy, and page 6 parking policy, under Metro actions, add an action to implement the actions and investments identified for these policy areas in the Climate Smart Strategy in the 2018 RTP: "**Implement the Climate Smart Communities Strategy streets and highways investments and actions in the 2018 RTP**"; "**Implement the Climate Smart Communities Strategy transportations system management investments and actions in the 2018 RTP**"; and "**Implement the Climate Smart Communities Strategy transportation demand management investments and actions in the 2018 RTP**"	Metro staff	10/24/14	*Amend as requested.*
29	**Toolbox of Possible Actions (2015-20) (Exhibit C)**	Page 5, using technology policy, add a new immediate term local government action to help implement the draft approach: "**Complete an inventory of the installed intelligent transportation systems (ITS) along arterials to help prioritize areas where limited funding could best be directed to increase roadway performance.**"	City of Hillsboro	9/24/14	*Amend as requested.*

#	Exhibit	Comment	Source(s)	Date	Staff recommendation
30	**Toolbox of Possible Actions (2015-20) (Exhibit C)**	Page 5, using technology policy, add new actions for all partners to recognize expanding role of ITS in the future: "**Pursue opportunities and funding for pilot projects that help establish the region as a living laboratory for sustainable and multi-modal ITS**;"**Seek opportunities to leverage Oregon's road user fee pilot project to provide additional services to participating drivers**;" and "**Develop a pilot project to test wireless charging of electric vehicles, ideally encompassing both transit vehicles and passenger cars**."	Drive Oregon	10/28/14	*Amend as requested.*
31	**Toolbox of Possible Actions (2015-20) (Exhibit C)**	Page 5, providing information and incentives policy, add new actions to integrate promotion of efficient vehicles and fuel choices in the promotion of other travel options: "**Clarify that e-bikes are part of the reg**	Drive Oregon	10/28/14	*Amend as requested.*
32	**Toolbox of Possible Actions (2015-20) (Exhibit C)**	Page 5, provide information and incentives, add new action to commit a larger portion of funds to expand travel options that will include grade-school populations and school staff through education and encouragement programs such as Safe Routes to School.	Safe Routes to School National Partnership	10/28/14	*No change recommended to Exhibit C. See also recommendation on Comment #15 in the Exhibit B section.* This comment has been forwarded to the Metro staff responsible for the Regional Flexible Fund Allocation (RFFA) process and ODOT staff responsible for Connect Oregon and the STIP process. JPACT and the Metro Council provide policy direction for prioritizing allocation of the federal flexible funds at the beginning of each RFFA cycle. The next RFFA cycle (and policy update) will begin in 2015.

#	Exhibit	Comment	Source(s)	Date	Staff recommendation
33	**Toolbox of Possible Actions (2015-20) (Exhibit C)**	Page 5, provide information and incentives, add new action to link completion of transportation and parking demand management initiatives to scoring criteria for infrastructure funding opportunities, e.g., regional flexible funds, ConnectOregon, and the Oregon Statewide Transportation Improvement Program.	Safe Routes to School National Partnership	10/28/14	*No change recommended to Exhibit C. See also recommendation on Comment #15 in the Exhibit B section.* The toolbox already includes separate actions to link system and transportation demand management to capital investments. In addition, this comment has been forwarded to the Metro staff responsible for the Regional Flexible Fund Allocation (RFFA) process and ODOT staff responsible for Connect Oregon and the STIP process. JPACT and the Metro Council provide policy direction for prioritizing allocation of the federal flexible funds at the beginning of each RFFA cycle. The next RFFA cycle (and policy update) will begin in 2015.
34	**Toolbox of Possible Actions (2015-20) (Exhibit C)**	Page 5, provide information and incentives, add new action on integrating use of new people mover services (Lyft, Uber, Car2Go) into urban transportation strategies.	Angus Duncan	10/2/14	*Amend as follows:* add new action "**Integrate promotion of carsharing and new people mover services into employer-based outreach programs that encourage transit, walking, bicycling and carpooling**;" add new action "**Integrate education about carsharing programs into public awareness strategies**."
35	**Toolbox of Possible Actions (2015-20) (Exhibit C)**	Page 6, parking policy, fully utilize parking pricing strategies. Parking spaces are not truly “free, and pricing is one of the most effective ways to manage demand. Cities should charge the fair market price for on-street parking, using the revenues to finance added public services in the metered neighborhoods. Likewise, parking minimums hurt housing affordability.	Oregon Environmental Council	10/15/14	*No change recommended to Exhibit C. See alo recommendations on Comments #36 and #37 in this section.* The draft toolbox currently identifies an action to research and update regional parking policies to reflect the range of parking approaches available for different types of development. The existing action is recommended to moved to the 2015-16 time period to inform the 2018 RTP update.
36	**Toolbox of Possible Actions (2015-20) (Exhibit C)**	Page 6, parking policy, under Metro actions, move the "near-term" action to research and update regional parking policies to "Immediate" time period. It will take time to complete the research and conduct pilot projects to inform the 2018 RTP update.	1000 Friends of Oregon	10/22/14	*Amend as requested and make the following change*: move immediate action to "discuss priced parking as a revenue source" to list of near-term actions as this should be informed by the parking research conducted in the "Immediate" time period. *See also recommendations on Comments #35 and #37 in this section.*

#	Exhibit	Comment	Source(s)	Date	Staff recommendation
37	**Toolbox of Possible Actions (2015-20) (Exhibit C)**	Page 6, parking policy, under Metro actions, add a new action to link providing different parking policies in mixed-use transit corridors and centers with maintaining and providing affordable housing (e.g., recoup some of the private savings from providing fewer parking spaces in a development served by frequent transit service and use the savings to provide for or preserve affordable housing in the corridor)."	1000 Friends of Oregon	10/22/14	*Amend as follows*: add **"and linking parking policies in mixed-use transit corridors and centers with maintaining and providing affordable housing."** *See also recommendations on Comments #35 and #36 in this section.*
38	**Toolbox of Possible Actions (2015-20) (Exhibit C)**	Page 6, parking policy, under Metro actions, move near-term action to "expand on-going technical assistance to local governments and others…" to immediate term.	Metro staff	10/24/14	*Amend as requested.*
39	**Toolbox of Possible Actions (2015-20) (Exhibit C)**	Page 7, support Oregon's transition to cleaner, low carbon fuels and more fuel efficient vehicles, move near-term action on updating development codes to encourage the installation of electric vehicle charging stations to immediate time period and revise as follows, "**Update development codes to streamline/incentivize/encourage the installation of electric vehicle charging stations and infrastructure, particularly in new buildings.**"	Technical work group member	10/9/14	*Amend as requested.*
40	**Toolbox of Possible Actions (2015-20) (Exhibit C)**	Page 5, parking policy, add new actions to integrate electric vehicles in parking plans and policies: "**Join the Workplace Charging Challenge as a partner**;" "**Develop and support pilot projects and model planning approaches to encourage highly visible charging infrastructure on-street and in the public right-of-way**;" "**Develop and support "charging oases" with multiple chargers, modeled on the Electric Avenue project at Portland State University**;" "**Support efforts to future proof new developments, particularly multi-family housing and large parking lots, by installing conduit for future charging of at least 20% of parking spaces, similar to standards in Hawaii, California and elsewhere**."	Drive Oregon	10/28/14	*Amend as requested.*
41	**Toolbox of Possible Actions (2015-20) (Exhibit C)**	Page 5, parking policy, add a new Metro action: "**Convene regional transportation and planning officials to develop strategies for developing cost-effective charging infrastructure that also reinforces regional planning goals."**	Drive Oregon	10/28/14	*Amend as requested.*

#	Exhibit	Comment	Source(s)	Date	Staff recommendation
42	**Toolbox of Possible Actions (2015-20) (Exhibit C)**	Page 5, Support Oregon's transition to cleaner fuels and more fuel efficient vehicles policy, add new Metro actions: "**Increase Metro fleet use of electric vehicles, including non-passenger cars (e-bikes and utility vehicles);" "Expand availability of charging at Metro venues (Oregon Zoo, Expo Center, Convention Center, P5, etc.)."**	Drive Oregon	10/28/14	*Amend as requested.*
43	**Toolbox of Possible Actions (2015-20) (Exhibit C)**	Page 5, Support Oregon's transition to cleaner fuels and more fuel efficient vehicles policy, add new actions for all partners: "**Support renewal of Oregon's tax credits for charing stations and other alternative fueling infrastructure**;" "**Support legislation being promoted by Drive Oregon and the Energize Oregon Coalition to create a purchase rebate for electric vehicles**;" and "**Join Drive Oregon an Energize Oregon Coalition as a member organization and participate as an active partner in promoting electric vehicle readiness and deployment."**	Drive Oregon	10/28/14	*Amend as requested.*
44	**Toolbox of Possible Actions (2015-20) (Exhibit C)**	Page 5, Support Oregon's transition to cleaner fuels and more fuel efficient vehicles policy, it is important to keep the region's options open to new technological advancements beyond what the state assumed in the setting the region's target. Periodic review is needed.	City of Hillsboro	10/30/14	*Amend to include a new state action as follows:* "**Review the state greenhoue gas emission reduction targets, including assumptions related to fleet and technology advancements**." This reflects OAR 660-044-0035, which directs LCDC and state agencies (e.g., DEQ, ODOT, DOE and DLCD) to periodically review the targets. The first review is due by June 1, 2015. Updated fleet and technology information will be accounted for in future analysis to determine whether the region is on track with meeting state targets for greenhouse gas emissions reduction. The next update to the RTP (due in 2018) will reflect the updated information.

#	Exhibit	Comment	Source(s)	Date	Staff recommendation
45	**Toolbox of Possible Actions (2015-20) (Exhibit C)**	Page 6, funding policy, Metro should use its leadership and role as the region's MPO to support and seek opportunities to advocate for new, dedicated funding mechanisms for active transportation and transit and leverage local, regional, state and federal funding to achieve local visions that align with region's desired outcomes.	Safe Routes to School National Partnership	10/28/14	*No change recommended to Exhibit C.* These actions are already identified on page 6 of the toolbox.
46	**Toolbox of Possible Actions (2015-20) (Exhibit C)**	Page 6, funding policy, under Metro actions, to include an action to prioritize active transportation and transit for funding.	Coalition for a Livable Future	10/30/14	*No change recommended to Exhibit C. See alsorecommendation on Comment #15 in the Exhibit B section.* This comment has been forwarded to the Metro staff responsible for the Regional Flexible Fund Allocation (RFFA) process and ODOT staff responsible for Connect Oregon and the STIP process. JPACT and the Metro Council provide policy direction for prioritizing allocation of the federal flexible funds at the beginning of each RFFA cycle. The next RFFA cycle (and policy update) will begin in 2015.
47	**Toolbox of Possible Actions (2015-20) (Exhibit C)**	Page 6, funding policy, under Metro actions, to include an action to increase funding for active transportation through the Regional Flexible Fund Allocation process.	Coalition for a Livable Future	10/30/14	
48	**Toolbox of Possible Actions (2015-20) (Exhibit C)**	Page 6, funding policy, under Metro actions, focus efforts on any funding coalition on federal and state funds. Funding strategies should not include a regional tax or jeopardize local funding sources, such as the sources Washington County and its cities have developed to serve existing communities and new growth areas.	City of Hillsboro	10/30/14	*See recommendation on comment #26 in this section for recomended change.* The intent of the actions in this section is for Metro and others to work together to secure adequate funding to implement adopted plans, recognizing it will take a combination of local, regional, state and federal funding sources. Metro has and continues to support maintaining local options for funding; as documented in past state and federal legislative agendas adopted by the Metro Council and JPACT. Funding efforts undertaken by Washington County and its cities are a model for other communitiesn, and also present an opportunity for the region to show federal and state partners the efforts to fund transportation needs locally. The next RTP update will include

#	Exhibit	Comment	Source(s)	Date	Staff recommendation
					updating the region's funding strategy, considering any new actions taken at the local, state and federal levels.
49	**Toolbox of Possible Actions (2015-20) (Exhibit C)**	Page 8, expand the list of Metro actions under "Demonstrate leadership on climate change" to include more specific actions like sharing development of the Climate Smart Strategy with other metropolitan areas and helping build understanding of how different tools and actions work, how they can help a community achieve its vision, and how everyone needs to be part of the solution. The actions listed are primarily focused on inventories, reports and plans.	Community leaders meeting and Oregon Environmental Council	10/1/14, 10/15/14	*Amend as requested.*
50	**Toolbox of Possible Actions (2015-20) (Exhibit C)**	Page 8, expand the list of Metro actions under "Demonstrate leadership on climate change" to include using Climate Smart Strategy as a filter for Metro's land use and transportation policy and investment decisions. Add language indicating these policy and investment decisions help the region achieve the target.	1000 Friends of Oregon, National Safe Routes to School Partnership, Coalition for a Livable Future	10/22/14, 10/28/14, 10/30/14	*Amend as follows:* "**Evaluate Metro's major land use and RTP policy and investment decisions to determine whether they help the region meet adopted targets for reducing greenhouse gas emissions.**" See also recommendation on comments #20 and #21 in Exhibit B section.
51	**Toolbox of Possible Actions (2015-20) (Exhibit C)**	Page 8, expand the list of Metro actions under "Demonstrate leadership on climate change" to include an action that states "**Update the Regional Transportation Plan to implement the Climate Smart Communities Strategy**." The update represents an opportunity to update performance measures, policies and the Regional Transportation Functional Plan.	Coalition for a Livable Future	10/30/14	*Amend as requested.*
52	**Toolbox of Possible Actions (2015-20) (Exhibit C)**	Reduce emissions by addresing the use of gas-powered lawn mowers and leaf-blowers.	Fran Mason	9/20/14	*No change recommended to Exhibit C.* These sources of emissions are outside of the scope of the Climate Smart Strategy.
53	**Toolbox of Possible Actions (2015-20) (Exhibit C)**	Require all tires be finished at the manufacturer to reduce friction.	Zephyr Moore	9/22/14	*No change recommended to Exhibit C.* This is beyond the scope of the project.
54	**Toolbox of Possible Actions (2015-20) (Exhibit C)**	Page 8, demonstrate leadership on climate change policy, add a new immediate term action for each partner: "**Review the *Toolbox of Possible Actions* to identify actions that are already being implemented and new actions public officials are willing to commit to.**"	City of Hillsboro	9/24/14	*Amend as requested.*

#	Exhibit	Comment	Source(s)	Date	Staff recommendation
55	**Toolbox of Possible Actions (2015-20) (Exhibit C)**	Ban wood burning and touch-and-go flight training at the Hillsboro airport to reduce exposure to particulates and leaded fuel emissions.	Gary and Ruth Warren	10/20/14	*No change recommended to Exhibit C.* These sources of emissions are outside of the scope of the Climate Smart Strategy. The comments have been forwarded to City of Hillsboro staff for their consideration.
56	**Toolbox of Possible Actions (2015-20) (Exhibit C)**	Do not adopt the toolbox as part of Ordinance 14-1346 to allow for more discussion and refinement of the toolbox using the technical work group. In addition, include an analysis and discussion of how the Toolbox of Possible Actions relates to the Statewide Transportation Strategy. The 8th and 9th clauses on page 3 of the draft ordinance should be amended to reflect such an effort, and the 4th "be it ordained" on Page 5 should be reworded as follows "**Metro Council directs staff to provide opportunities for further review and refinement of the Toolbox of Actions by local governments, ODOT, TriMet and other stakeholders**."	City of Hillsboro	10/30/14	Amend the 4th "be it ordained" in the draft ordinance as follows: "**Metro Council directs staff to provide opportunities for further review and refinement of the Toolbox of Actions by local governments, ODOT, TriMet and other stakeholders as part of the RTP update**." Consultation with DLCD and ODOT staff have confirmed the toolbox is a necessary component of the adoption package.The toolbox contains policies and strategies intended to achieve the target and is, therefore, a necessary part of the overall preferred strategy for meeting the target under OAR-660-0040(3)(c). The toolbox does not mandate local adoption of any particular policy or action, and serves is a starting point for the region to begin implementation of the CSC strategy. As such, the toolbox reflects near-term actions that can be taken in the next 5 years, recognizing that medium and longer term actions will be identified through the next scheduled update to the RTP. Staff has recommended refinements to the toolbox to respond to specific comments received during the comment period. Adoption of the toolbox directs staff to include the toolbox in the RTP appendix as a starting point for further refinement during the next RTP update. Adoption of the toolbox in Ordinance 14-1346 directs staff to incorporate the toolbox into the technical appendix of the RTP, recognizing more work is needed during the RTP update to identify medium and longer-term implementation actions. A comparison of the STS and toolbox will be developed at that time.
57	**Toolbox of Possible Actions (2015-20) (Exhibit C)**	Define unfamiliar terms in the toolbox, such as Vision Zero Strategy and EcoRule, to provide more clarity on the actions being recommended.	City of Hillsboro	10/30/14	*Amend as requested.* Include a glossary of terms, using the glossary in Exhibit A as a starting point.

#	Exhibit	Comment	Source(s)	Date	Staff recommendation
58	**Toolbox of Possible Actions (2015-20) (Exhibit C)**	The toolbox should also have an action to develop new urban areas in ways that further the region's efforts in achieving greenhouse gas emissions reductions, such as planning for complete communities with walking, biking and transit options as part of concept planning to reduce or eliminate vehicle trips for every day needs (e.g., shopping, school, recreation).	City of Hillsboro	10/30/14	*Amend as requested.* *In addition, amend Policy 1.7.5(a) and (d) of Chapter 1 of the Regional Framework Plan as follows:* "a. Help achieve livable communities **and reduce greenhouse gas emissions**." "d. Determine the general urban land uses, **key local and regional multi-modal transportation facilities** and prospective components of the regional system of parks, natural areas..."
59	**Toolbox of Possible Actions (2015-20) (Exhibit C)**	Add language to the toolbox to more clearly articulate the ability to "locally tailor" implementation tools.	Clackamas County Board of Commissioners, City of Hillsboro, City of Happy Valley	10/22/14, 10/30/14, 10/30/14	*Amend as requested.*
60	**Toolbox of Possible Actions (2015-20) (Exhibit C)**	Remove the toolbox from the adoption package, adopt by separate resolution and/or delay adoption to allow more time for review and refinement.	Mayor Willey, City of Hillsboro Keith Mays, Washington County Citizen Mayor Tim Knapp, Cities of Clackamas County Marilyn McWilliams, Washington County Special Districts Lise Glancy, Port of Portland Jeff Gudman, City of Lake Oswego	11/7/14	*This is addressed in part in the staff recommendation on Comment #56 in this section of Exhibit E.* *To address comments provided at the Nov. 7 joint MPAC/JPACT meeting, staff recommends the following additional changes to the clauses on page 4 of the ordinance:* WHEREAS, ~~while~~ the toolbox provides an **advisory menu of** possible actions and does not ~~mandate adoption of~~ **require local governments, special districts, or state agencies to adopt** any particular policy or action; and **WHEREAS, MPAC and JPACT recommend the toolbox be a living document subject to further review and refinement by local governments, ODOT, TriMet and other stakeholders as part of federally-required updates to the RTP to reflect new information and approaches to reducing greenhouse gas emissions; and** WHEREAS, MPAC and JPACT agree updates to local comprehensive plans and development regulations, transit agency plans, port district plans and regional growth management and transportation plans present continuing opportunities to **consider** implement**ing the actions recommended in** the toolbox ~~of possible actions~~ in ~~that can be~~ locally tailored **ways**; and

#	Exhibit	Comment	Source(s)	Date	Staff recommendation
61	**Toolbox of Possible Actions (2015-20) (Exhibit C)**	Draft toolbox introduction does not adequately convey the flexibility and local control intended for the toolbox. The toolbox should be adopted with language that more strongly conveys it is a flexible, living document that can be updated and refined as we learn more.	Ruth Adkins, Portland Public Schools	11/7/14	*This comment was addressed in part in staff recommendation on Comment #56 in this section of Exhibit E.* *Based on November 7 discussion, staff also recommends the following changes be made:* Amend toolbox introduction to better reflect language included in ordinance adopting the Climate Smart Strategy and supporting staff report.
62	**Toolbox of Possible Actions (2015-20) (Exhibit C)**	Add glossary to toolbox to improve clarity	Jim Bernards, Clackamas County Commissioner	11/7/14	*This comment was addressed in the staff recommendation on Comment #58 on in this section of Exhibit E.*
63	**Toolbox of Possible Actions (2015-20) (Exhibit C)**	Add implementing local transportation system plans to toolbox and strategy	Paul Savas, Clackamas County Commissioner	11/7/14	*Amend toolbox as requested and amend Exhibit A to more clearly describe that local transportation system plans (and local land use plans) are components of the Climate Smart Strategy.* *See also recommendation on comment #20 in in the Exhibit A section.*

End of comments and recommended changes to Exhibit C

#	Exhibit	Comment	Source(s)	Date	Staff recommendation
Comments on Performance Monitoring Approach (Exhibit D)					
1	**Performance Monitoring Approach (Exhibit D)**	Use model assumptions or outputs for 2035 to define targets for purposes of monitoring and assessing whether key elements of the Climate Smart Strategy are being implemented.	Metro staff in consultation with DLCD staff	10/24/14	*Amend as requested.* The measure and target will be reviewed as part of the next federally-required update to the RTP.
2	**Performance Monitoring Approach (Exhibit D)**	The performance monitoring should explicitly include measurement of equity outcomes. For example, share of low-income households near transit.	Safe Routes to School National Partnership	10/28/14	*Amend as requested.* The measure and target will be reviewed as part of the next federally-required update to the RTP.
3	**Performance Monitoring Approach (Exhibit D)**	Ensure social equity and health goals are considered when prioritizing investments by explicitly and transparently addressing how investments link low-income and other vulnerable households to health-promoting resources.	Oregon Health Authority	10/7/14	*No change recommended to Exhibit D. See also recommendation on Comments #4 and #5 in this section.* This project underscored the significant public health, economic and equity benefits of actions and investments that reduce greenhouse gas emissions. Metro's Equity Strategy (currently under development) and the Climate Smart Strategy Health Impact Assessment and recommendations will inform how future regional planning efforts (including RTP updates) will consider equity and public health.
4	**Performance Monitoring Approach (Exhibit D)**	Maximize health benefits by monitoring key health indicators, expanding partnerships that promote health and developing tools to support the consideration of health impacts in future land use and transportation decisions throughout the region.	Oregon Health Authority	10/7/14	*No change recommended to Exhibit D.* This comment has been forwarded to the Metro staff responsible for Metro's Equity Strategy (currently under development). The process has identified potential health indicators for Metro and other partners to monitor given the link between health and social equity. A baseline report and performance measures recommendations are expected in 2015.
5	**Performance Monitoring Approach (Exhibit D)**	ODOT and Metro should continue working with other State and regional partners, such as the Oregon Modeling Steering Committee and Health and Transportation Subcommittee of the OMSC, to develop tools to support assessments that measure the impact future plans have on air quality, safety, active transportation and climate change.	Oregon Health Authority	10/7/14	*No change recommended to Exhibit D; however amend Exhibit C, Toolbox of Possible Actions, as follows:* "**Continue participating in the Oregon Modeling Steering Committee Health and Transportation Subcommittee to make recommendations to ODOT on tools and methods to support future health assessments by local, regional and state partners**." This would be a new action for the State and for Metro. The work will continue in 2015 and 2016.

#	Exhibit	Comment	Source(s)	Date	Staff recommendation
6	**Performance Monitoring Approach (Exhibit D)**	Page 1, add transit ridership as a measure. Transit revenue hours only tells part of the story.	Community leaders meeting	10/1/14	*Amend as requested.* This measure is currently reported every two years by Metro in response to ORS 197.301 and as part of federally-required updates to the RTP. The measure and target will be reviewed as part of the next federally-required update to the RTP.
7	**Performance Monitoring Approach (Exhibit D)**	Page 1, add a transit affordability measure, such as tracking transit fares over time compared to inflation.	Community leaders meeting, Transportation Justice Alliance	10/1/14, 10/30/14	*Amend as requested.* The measure and target will be reviewed as part of the next federally-required update to the RTP.
8	**Performance Monitoring Approach (Exhibit D)**	Page 1, add household housing/transportation cost burden measure to monitor housing and transportation affordability in the region and link it to a goal to reduce the percentage of cost-burdened households, by increasing affordable housing, in transit centers and corridors.	Community leaders meeting, 1000 Friends of Oregon, Oregon Environmental Council, Coalition for a Livable Future, Transportation Justice Alliance	10/1/14, 10/15/14, 10/22/14, 10/30/14, 10/30/14	*Amend as requested.* Chapter 1, Objective 1.3.3 of the Regional Framework Plan includes a policy to reduce the share of housing and transportation cost-burdened households. This measure is currently reported as part of scheduled updates to the RTP and the Urban Growth Report. The RTP also identifies a target to reduce the percentage of cost-burdened households. The measure and target will be reviewed as part of the next federally-required update to the RTP.
9	**Performance Monitoring Approach (Exhibit D)**	Add daily pedestrian and bicycle miles traveled or time measure, and set a target of meeting or exceeding 1.8 miles walked and 3.4 miles cycled per person per week by 2035 as projected in the Draft Approach to emphasize the health benefits. The largest public health benefits come from increases in active transportation distance and/or time.	Community leaders meeting, Oregon Health Authority, 1000 Friends of Oregon	10/1/14, 10/7/14, 10/22/14	*No change recommended to Exhibit D.* Average daily miles of bicycle and pedestrian travel is already proposed as a measure, using model outputs to establish a 2010 baseline and 2035 target for daily bicycle and pedestrian miles traveled. This measure will be reported as part of federally-required updates to the RTP (currently every four years). The measure and target will be reviewed as part of the next federally-required update to the RTP.
10	**Performance Monitoring Approach (Exhibit D)**	Add a measure to track regional ambient concentrations of PM 2.5 and set target to reduce to 6.41 ug/m3 or below as projected in the draft Approach analysis.	Oregon Health Authority, 1000 Friends of Oregon	10/7/14, 10/22/14	*Amend as requested to use model outputs to establish a 2035 target for PM 2.5.* This measure is currently reported every two years by Metro in response to ORS 197.301 and federally-required updates to the RTP as part of the region's air quality conformity analysis. The measure and target will be reviewed as part of the next federally-required update to the RTP.

#	Exhibit	Comment	Source(s)	Date	Staff recommendation
11	**Performance Monitoring Approach (Exhibit D)**	Revise target for fatalities and serious injury crashes for all modes to be zero by 2035.	Community leaders meeting, National Safe Routes to School Partnership	10/1/14, 10/28/14	*No change recommended to Exhibit D.* The target reflects targets adopted in the 2014 RTP, which calls for reducing serious and severe injury crashes by 50 percent from 2010 levels. The adopted target will be reviewed as part of the next federally-required update to the RTP and the scheduled update to the Regional Transportation Safety Action Plan in 2015-16.
12	**Performance Monitoring Approach (Exhibit D)**	Add specific actions that Metro will take to incent, reward success and penalize failure in achieving progress toward meeting the adopted Climate Smart Strategy.	1000 Friends of Oregon, National Safe Routes to School Partnership	10/22/14, 10/28/14	*No change recommended to Exhibit D. See also recommendation on comment #21 in Exhibit B section.* The performance monitoring approach calls for Metro to report identified performance measures to DLCD and the region to inform policymakers on the region's progress toward implementing the Climate Smart Strategy. Chapter 7 (Management), Action 7.8.6 of the Regional Framework Plan calls for Metro to "Take corrective actions if anticipated progress is found to be lacking or if Metro goals or policies need adjustment..."
13	**Performance Monitoring Approach (Exhibit D)**	Set benchmark dates for evaluating progress on the immediate and near-term actions and a commitment to take appropriate steps, if necessary, to maintain progress towards the target GHG reduction.	1000 Friends of Oregon, National Safe Routes to School Partnership	10/22/14, 10/28/14	*No change recommended to Exhibit D. See also Comment 12 in this section and comments 20-21 in Exhibit B section.* The performance monitoring approach calls for Metro to report identified performance measures to DLCD and the region every 2-4 years to inform policymakers on the region's progress toward implementing the Climate Smart Strategy. Chapter 7 (Management), Action 7.8.6 of the Regional Framework Plan calls for Metro to "Take corrective actions if anticipated progress is found to be lacking or if Metro goals or policies need adjustment..."

Staff Recommendation on Public Comments Received for TPAC and MTAC Review

#	Exhibit	Comment	Source(s)	Date	Staff recommendation
14	**Performance Monitoring Approach (Exhibit D)**	Review the indicators developed for Mosaic, the value and cost informed transportation planning tool recently developed by ODOT, to determine whether any of the quantitative and qualitative indicators are appropriate to use.	Oregon Environmental Council	10/15/14	*No change recommended to Exhibit D.* Staff reviewed the Mosaic indicators, some of which are still under development by ODOT. Several Mosaic indicators are already included in the performance monitoring approach. All of the measures and recommended targets will be reviewed, and possibly refined, as part of the next federally-required update to the RTP. The next update will also address MAP-21 performance-based planning provisions and recommendations from Metro's Equity Strategy initiative. Staff will review the Mosaic indicators again at that time to determine whether additional indicators may be appropriate to use.
15	**Performance Monitoring Approach (Exhibit D)**	Page 3, add public EV charging stations as measure for the policy related to Oregon's transition to cleaner fuels and more fuel-efficient vehicles	Oregon Environmental Council	10/15/14	*No change recommended to Exhibit D.* Tracking the share of light duty vehicles registered in Oregon that are electric or plug-in hybrid electric is a more direct measure of Oregon's transition to more fuel efficient vehicle technologies.
16	**Performance Monitoring Approach (Exhibit D)**	Page 1, adopt a measure for 20-minute neighborhood for the policy “Implement the 2040 Growth Concept and local adopted land use and transportation plans.”	Oregon Environmental Council	10/15/14	*Amend as follows:* Add a new measure to track the share of households living in areas with relatively good, walkable access to a mix of destinations that support a range of daily needs (e.g., jobs, retail and commercial services, transit, parks, schools). GreenSTEP estimated 26% of the region's households lived in these types of areas in 2010, and that the share of households would grow to 37% by 2035. The measure and target will be reviewed as part of the next federally-required update to the RTP.
17	**Performance Monitoring Approach (Exhibit D)**	Page 3, develop a more specific measure for the policy area “secure adequate funding for transportation investments,"such as e.g., 60% of transit needs met by 20XX, 75% of sidewalk infrastructure complete by 20XX.	Community leaders meeting, Oregon Environmental Council	10/1/14, 10/15/14	*No change recommended to Exhibit D.* The performance monitoring approach includes measures to track system completeness. In addition, the next update to the Regional Transportation Plan (due in 2018) will update financial assumptions and define performance measures to track implementation.

#	Exhibit	Comment	Source(s)	Date	Staff recommendation
18	**Performance Monitoring Approach (Exhibit D)**	Metro should establish a public engagement process that is diverse and inclusive to oversee implementation of the Climate Smart Strategy.	1000 Friends of Oregon, Transportation Justice Alliance	10/22/14, 10/30/14	*No change recommended to Exhibit D.* The Climate Smart Strategy will be implemented through existing regional planning and decision-making processes, including RTP updates, RFFA processes, growth management decisions and corridor planning, as well as through local and state planning and decision-making processes, rather than a specific Climate Smart implementation program. Through its planning processes, in coordination with its Equity Strategy (currently under development), Metro is committed to continue to improve its engagement practices to ensure more diverse perspectives – especially those of traditionally underrepresented communities – are meaningfully engaged in regional planning, decision-making, and on-going implementation activities. Future public engagement processes will be developed in coordination with Metro's diversity, equity and inclusion program and Metro's existing advisory committees, and follow the best practices and processes set out in Metro's Public Engagement Guide. Staff will begin scoping the work plan and engagement process for the next scheduled update to the RTP in 2015. The update is expected to occur over multiple years in order to address federal and state planning requirements and policy considerations and engagement recommendations identified through the Climate Smart Communities effort and the 2014 RTP update.
19	**Performance Monitoring Approach (Exhibit D)**	Add measure to track congestion	Paul Savas, Clackamas County Commissioner	11/7/14	*No change needed.* The draft performance monitoring approach includes travel time reliability in regional mobility corridors, which complements other system performance measures identified in the Regional Transportation Plan and that are also used to regularly update the Regional Mobility Atlas to meet federally-required reporting and monitoring of the region's congestion management process. The Regional Mobility Atlas will be updated as part of the next RTP update. The 2010 atlas can be viewed online at /www.oregonmetro.gov/mobility-corridors-atlas

#	Exhibit	Comment	Source(s)	Date	Staff recommendation
20	**Performance Monitoring Approach (Exhibit D)**	Add jobs/housing balance measure	Mayor Tim Knapp, Cities of Clackamas County	11/7/14	*No change to Exhibit D recommended.* The proposed performance measures are intended to track regional progress towards meeting carbon reduction goals. While jobs/housing balance is important from the perspective of local community design, staff believes that cities are best positioned to decide how to produce more housing or jobs in their communities. Consequently, staff does not recommend a change to the proposed regional performance monitoring approaching. Cities and counties may wish to track local jobs/housing balance to inform their efforts. Staff is aware of stakeholder interest in the relationship between local jobs/housing balance and regional commute patterns, with the idea that providing more land for housing jobs will reduce commute distances. However, Census data illustrate that people commute all over the region for work regardless of whether there are jobs close to where they live or vice versa. This is particularly the case with dual-income households and the trend of people changing not just jobs, but careers with greater frequency. Using the City of Wilsonville as an example, about 90 percent of the people that work in Wilsonville commute from outside Wilsonville and about 80 percent of the workers that reside in Wilsonville commute elsewhere for work. The 2014 Residential Preference study also illustrated that people will tolerate longer commutes to live in the type of neighborhood that they prefer. For this program's purposes, staff believes that other proposed measures of transportation system performance are more useful than measures of jobs/housing balance.

End of comments and recommended changes to Exhibit D

#	Exhibit	Comment	Source(s)	Date	Staff recommendation
Comments on Short List of Actions (Exhibit F)					
1	**Short List of Actions for 2015 and 2016**	Add congestion pricing as a potential demonstration project in the short list of actions	Paul Savas, Clackamas County Commissioner	11/7/14	*No change recommended. This comment has been forwarded to ODOT staff and project staff responsible for the next update to the Regional Transportation Plan for consideration.* This policy is already identified in the Regional Transportation Plan as potential tool for managing congestion and improving the reliability of the region's mobility corridors. It was not tested as part of the Climate Smart Communities project because concurrent with earlier phases of the CSC project, ODOT, in partnership with Metro, the three counties and the City of Portland, explored the potential for a congestion pricing pilot project in the region. Directed by House Bill 2001, the study concluded in 2011 and did not recommend implementation of any of the road tolling proposals under consideration. The study participants did recommend moving forward with the City of Portland Parking Management proposal as the congestion pricing pilot. The pilot began in spring 2011 with event parking pricing around Jeld-Wen Field during Timbers games. More information can be found at: www.oregon.gov/odot/hwy/region1/pages/congestionpricing/index.aspx
Comments on Short List of Actions (Exhibit F)					

This page left blank for printing purposes.